CHAPTER 3. BUSINESS LOCATION-METHODOLOGY NOTE

I. MOTIVATION

Acquiring the physical space where a business will operate is a crucial ingredient of success for many firms, even in the digital age. Getting the right location can influence business access to customers, transportation, labor, and materials, as well as determine taxes, regulations, and environmental commitments they must comply with. Whether an entrepreneur is leasing or purchasing a commercial property, the regulatory framework and the public services related to acquiring a location can have an impact on how conducive the business environment is for individual firms and the private sector development of an economy. Firms are more likely to invest in economies with strong property rights, where they can be confident that their investment in immovable property will be safe. Looking at how well the administration of property rights functions gives a good indication of the economy's prospects for economic growth and provides confidence to the private sector in investing in strategic locations for businesses. Quality and transparency of land administration are also vital in reducing information asymmetries and increasing market efficiency. A reliable land administration system provides clear information on property ownership, facilitates the development of real estate markets, and supports security of tenure.

When investors and entrepreneurs acquire a new location for their business, the process often involves licensing requirements for altering a property or changing tenancy. Building-related permits are essential for public safety, strengthening property rights, and contributing to capital formation. Last but not least, transparent and accessible environmental regulations related to building control reduce the regulatory burden on firms by offering clarity on rules and regulations.

In this context, the Business Location topic measures the effectiveness of the regulatory framework, the quality of governance, and the transparency and operational efficiency in providing services for property transfer, building, and environmental permits. The topic indicators consider both the perspective of the firm/entrepreneur (firm flexibility) and the broader public (social benefits). Most of the indicators under the regulatory framework pillar and the public services pillar measure both firm flexibility and social benefits, while indicators under the operational efficiency pillar relate to firm flexibility only.

II. INDICATORS

The Business Location topic measures three different options—purchase, lease, or build—that are available to entrepreneurs to choose the adequate location to set up their company, across three different dimensions, here referred to as pillars. The first pillar assesses the quality of regulations pertaining to property transfer, building, and environmental permitting, covering de jure features of a regulatory framework that are necessary for immovable property lease, property ownership, urban planning, and environmental licenses. The second pillar assesses the quality of public services and transparency of information in the provision of property transfer, building, and environmental permitting. The third pillar measures the operational efficiency of establishing a business location in practice. Each pillar is divided into categories—defined by common features that inform the grouping into a particular category—and each category is further divided into subcategories. Each subcategory consists of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, have several components. Relevant points are assigned to each indicator and subsequently aggregated to obtain the number of points for each subcategory, category, and pillar. Table 1 includes a summary of all three pillars along with their respective categories and subcategories.

Table 1. Summary Table of all Three Pillars for the Business Location Topic

Pillar I–Qu	ality of Regulations for Business Location (66 indicators)
1.1	Property Transfer and Land Administration (12 indicators)

111 D (T) (C) 1 1 (A' 1')				
1.1.1	Property Transfer Standards (4 indicators)			
1.1.2	Land Dispute Mechanisms (4 indicators) Land Administration System (4 indicators)			
1.1.3				
1.2	Building, Zoning and Land Use (20 indicators)			
1.2.1	Building Standards (12 indicators)			
1.2.2	Building Energy Standards (3 indicators)			
1.2.3	Zoning and Land Use Regulations (5 indicators)			
1.3	Restrictions on Owning and Leasing Property (19 indicators)			
1.3.1	Domestic Firms–Ownership (4 indicators)			
1.3.2	Domestic Firms–Leasehold (5 indicators)			
1.3.3	Foreign Firms-Ownership (5 indicators)			
1.3.4	Foreign Firms-Leasehold (5 indicators)			
1.4	Environmental Permits (15 indicators)			
1.4.1	Environmental Permits for Construction (13 indicators)			
1.4.2	Dispute Mechanisms for Construction-Related Environmental Permits (2 indicators)			
Pillar II–Q	uality of Public Services and Transparency of Information for Business Location (52 indicators)			
2.1	Availability and Reliability of Digital Services (23 indicators)			
2.1.1	Property Transfer-Digital Public Services (7 indicators)			
2.1.2	Property Transfer–Digital Land Management and Identification System (4 indicators)			
2.1.3	Property Transfer-Coverage of the Land Registry and Mapping Agency (4 indicators)			
2.1.4 Building Permits–Digital Public Services (4 indicators)				
2.1.5				
2.2				
2.2.1	Interoperability of Services for Property Transfer (4 indicators)			
2.2.2	Interoperability of Services for Building Permits (2 indicators)			
2.3	Transparency of Information (23 indicators)			
2.3.1	Immovable Property (includes gender) (12 indicators)			
2.3.2	Building, Zoning and Land Use (8 indicators)			
2.3.3	Environmental Permits (3 indicators)			
Pillar III–C	Operational Efficiency of Establishing a Business Location (8 indicators)			
3.1	Property Transfer and Land Administration (3 indicators)			
3.1.1	Major Constraints on Access to Land (1 indicator)			
3.1.2 Time to Transfer a Property (1 indicator)				
3.1.3				
3.2	Construction Permits (3 indicators)			
3.2.1	Time to Obtain a Construction-Related Permits (1 indicator)			
3.2.2	Time to Obtain a Building Permit (1 indicator)			
3.2.3	Cost to Obtain a Building Permit (1 indicator)			
3.3	Environmental Permit (2 indicators)			
3.3.1				
	Cost to Obtain an Environmental Permit (1 indicator)			

1. PILLAR I. QUALITY OF REGULATIONS FOR BUSINESS LOCATION

Table 2 shows the structure for Pillar I, Quality of Regulations for Business Location. Each of this pillar's categories and subcategories will be discussed in more detail in the order shown in the table.

Table 2. Pillar I-Quality of Regulations for Business Location

- 110-10 - 1 - 1-110-1			
1.1 Property Transfer and Land Administration			
1.1.1	Property Transfer Standards		

1.1.2	Land Dispute Mechanisms	
1.1.3	Land Administration System	
1.2	Building, Zoning and Land Use	
1.2.1	Building Standards	
1.2.2	Building Energy Standards	
1.2.3	Zoning and Land Use Regulations	
1.3	Restrictions on Owning and Leasing Property	
1.3.1	Domestic Firms-Ownership	
1.3.2	Domestic Firms-Leasehold	
1.3.3	Foreign Firms-Ownership	
1.3.4	Foreign Firms–Leasehold	
1.4	Environmental Permits	
1.4.1	Environmental Permits for Construction	
1.4.2	Dispute Mechanisms for Construction-Related Environmental Permits	

1.1 Property Transfer and Land Administration

Category 1.1 is divided into three subcategories consisting of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, have several components.

1.1.1 Property Transfer Standards

A sound regulatory framework is essential to ensure secure property transactions. Having processes that ascertain rightful ownership and registration of sale deeds in the immovable property registry increases security for people.⁵ Effective property transfer standards can improve efficiency and transparency of property transactions, reduce costs, and increase accuracy of property information.⁶ Therefore, Subcategory 1.1.1–Property Transfer Standards comprises four indicators (table 3).

Table 3. Subcategory 1.1.1-Property Transfer Standards

	Indicators	Components		Components	
1	Legal Obligation to Check Compliance of Documents with the Law	Requiring a control of legality of the documents necessary for a property transaction			
2	Legal Obligation to Verify Identities of Parties	Requiring verification of the identity of each party engaged in a property transaction			
3	Legal Obligation to Register Sales Transactions	Requiring that all property sale transactions be registered at the immovable property registry to make them enforceable against third parties			
4	Legal Provision on the Legality of Online Documents	 i) Property title certificate ii) Title search certificate iii) Tax certificate iv) Company profile document v) Cadastral plans 			

1.1.2 Land Dispute Mechanisms

In some economies, land disputes make up most of the volume of court cases. To prevent land disputes and better manage the existing ones, the legal framework for land administration needs to assign clear responsibilities to stakeholders involved in land transactions as well as provide effective mechanisms of dispute resolution that can be implemented in a consistent way and be accessible to all. Disputes can also occur due to errors in title registration, resulting in significant losses to affected parties, including property owners and lenders. To complement that, available evidence suggests that offering an out-of-court compensation mechanism has the potential to reduce court cases. Therefore, Subcategory 1.1.2–Land Dispute Mechanisms comprises four indicators (table 4).

Table 4. Subcategory 1.1.2–Land Dispute Mechanisms

1	Legal Provisions for Arbitration as an Alternative Land Disputes Resolution Mechanism	Arbitration offered as an out-of-court resolution mechanism for land disputes
2	Legal Provisions for Conciliation or Mediation as Alternative Land Disputes Resolution Mechanisms	Conciliation or mediation offered as an out-of-court resolution mechanism for land disputes
3	Legal Provisions for Protection of Property Title	Property title subject to a guarantee
4	Legal Provisions to Provide Out- of-Court Compensation for Losses due to Erroneous Information from the Immovable Property Registry	Out-of-court compensation mechanism to allow for compensation payments to parties who suffer losses due to an error in title registration

1.1.3 Land Administration System

Having a reliable, transparent, and secure land registration system is important to support the security of land tenure and facilitates development of an efficient land market. Such a system must provide clear and accurate information on land ownership, boundaries, and land use rights to all stakeholders, including government agencies, landowners, investors, and the public. ¹⁰ The higher the quality of the land administration system, the higher the chance of getting credit when using property as collateral, thereby increasing incentives for investment. Good practices include having transparency of information because it eliminates the asymmetry of information between users and officials and increases the efficiency of land markets, as well as a sound infrastructure to maintain land information supported by an appropriate institutional framework. ¹¹ Therefore, Subcategory 1.1.3–Land Administration System comprises four indicators (table 5).

Table 5. Subcategory 1.1.3-Land Administration System

	Indicators	Components
1	Disclosure of Immovable Property Registry Information	Access to property ownership information
2	Infrastructure for Land Administration	Existence of cadaster/mapping agency (institution in charge of surveying each plot of land)
3	Disclosure of Cadastral Information	Access to cadastral plans of privately held land plots
	Integration of Land Administration and Tax Value Information	Cadaster (or immovable property registry) includes information on tax value of the real property

1.2 Building, Zoning and Land Use

Category 1.2 is divided into three subcategories consisting of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, have several components.

1.2.1 Building Standards

Having a defined set of building regulation standards is important to ensure that buildings are constructed, maintained, and used in a way that minimizes the risk of harm to individuals and the environment. Having clear and publicly accessible building regulations, as well as clear regulations regarding safety mechanisms in construction, is key to guaranteeing a safe construction process. ¹² Therefore, Subcategory 1.2.1–Building Standards comprises twelve indicators (table 6).

Table 6. Subcategory 1.2.1–Building Standards

	Indicators	Components
1	Building Codes/Standards Applicable to all Constructions	Existence of unified building standards

2	Clear Provisions or Guidelines regarding Safety Standards	i) Structural Resilience ii) Fire Safety iii) Accessibility and Inclusivity iv) Health and Sanitation v) Energy Efficiency in Building Design and Sustainability vi) Building Classification vii) Land Use Regulations viii) Quality Assurance Inspections and Compliance Enforcement ix) Maintenance and Renovation Requirements
3	Regulation of Health Risk Related to Construction Materials	Regulatory framework requirements for handling, removing, or disposing of hazardous construction materials (e.g. asbestos, lead, mercury devices, or polychlorinated biphenyls)
4	Responsibility for Compliance with Legal Requirements	i) Public agencyii) Third-party architectural and engineering firms
5	Qualifications to Conduct Technical Supervision/Inspections	 i) Is an architect or engineer ii) Pass a mandatory exam iii) Years of practical experience iv) Member of association of architects or civil engineers
6	Type of Inspections Carried Out During Construction	Type of inspections carried out during construction required by law during construction to assure structural safety i) Phased ii) Risk-based
7	Responsibility for Conducting Inspections During Construction	 i) Third-party engineer or engineering firm ii) Governmental agencies
8	Requirement of Final Inspection by Law	Requirement of final inspection by law before a building can be occupied
9	Liability for Structural Flaws/Problems	 i) Liability of construction company architect or engineer ii) Liability of third-party inspectors iii) Liability of government agencies
10	Occupancy Permit	Requirement of an occupancy permit before a building can be occupied
11	Ability to Dispute Building Permit Decisions	Ability to dispute building permit decisions
12	Building Control Agency Authority	 i) Ability to issue emergency orders to address building safety concerns ii) Authority to issue orders against non-compliance with building regulations iii) Authority to initiate prosecution in a court for building codes violation iv) Authority to recommend license suspension for non-compliant building practitioners

1.2.2 Building Energy Standards

Building energy standards are essential tools for promoting energy efficiency and reducing greenhouse gas emissions in the building sector. Building energy standards are regulatory requirements that set minimum energy efficiency requirements for new buildings.¹³ Energy efficiency performance standards in building energy codes typically include several key elements, including building envelope requirements, lighting, and heating and cooling requirements. ¹⁴ Therefore, Subcategory 1.2.2–Building Energy Standards comprises three indicators (table 7).

Table 7. Subcategory 1.2.2-Building Energy Standards

	Tuble 71 Subcategoly 11212 Danding Energy Standards			
	Indicators	Components		
1	Mandatory Minimum Energy Efficiency Performance Standards	Mandatory minimum energy efficiency performance standards		
2	Energy Efficiency Performance Standards are Verified as Part of the Building Plans Review Process	 i) Thermal transmittance or insulation calculations for building envelope ii) Solar heat gain calculations for building envelope iii) Glazing factors for fenestration iv) Heating/cooling demand calculations v) Daylighting and orientation 		

Ī			vi)	Permanent shading
			vii)	Air barrier, air leakage or air infiltration
			viii)	Efficiency of heating and cooling equipment and controls
			ix)	Efficiency of water heating equipment and controls
			x)	Efficiency of lighting fixtures and controls
			xi)	Insulation and heat traps
	3	Incentives to Promote Green Building Standards		Incentives to promote green building standards

1.2.3 Zoning and Land Use Regulations

Zoning is a planning control tool for regulating the built environment and creating functional real estate markets. Effective zoning and land use planning ensures sustainable and safe urban development planning to ensure equitable access to services such as water, electricity, and sanitation. Hazard maps and related means are also essential to identify areas where construction of buildings is not permitted due to natural hazards and to determine minimum separation distances between residential and hazardous occupancies. Zoning can also provide the opportunity to stimulate or slow down development in specific areas. Therefore, Subcategory 1.2.3–Zoning and Land Use Regulations comprises five indicators on land use and zoning regulations (table 8).

Table 8. Subcategory 1.2.3–Zoning and Land Use Regulations

	Indicators	Components
1	Requirements for Essential Infrastructure Service Access (Water, Electricity, Sanitation)	Requirements for essential infrastructure service access (water, electricity, sanitation)
2	Maps that Identify Areas Allocated to Residential, Commercial, Agricultural, Recreational, Public/Institutional, Mixed Use	Land use maps that identify areas allocated to residential, commercial, agricultural, recreational, public/institutional, mixed use
3	Hazard Maps that Identify Areas where Construction is not Permitted due to Natural Hazards	Hazard maps that identify areas where construction is not permitted due to natural hazards
4	Hazard Maps that Identify Minimum Separation Between Residential and Hazardous Occupancies	Hazard maps that identify minimum separation between residential and hazardous occupancies
5	Maps that Identify Areas in which Building is not Permitted in relation to Natural Resources	Maps that identify areas in which construction is prohibited due considerations such as conservation areas, water bodies, environmentally sensitive zones or other natural resource related factors

1.3 Restrictions on Owning and Leasing Property

Category 1.3 is divided into four subcategories consisting of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, have several components.

1.3.1 Domestic Firms-Ownership

Restrictions for domestic firms to own a property limit their ability to access capital and other resources, which can hinder competitiveness and reduce investments. ¹⁸ Therefore, Subcategory 1.3.1–Domestic Firms–Ownership comprises four indicators (table 9).

Table 9. Subcategory 1.3.1–Domestic Firms–Ownership

	Indicators	Components
	Restriction on Ownership Based	
1	on the Area of the Land for	Restriction on ownership based on the area of the land for domestic firms
	Domestic Firms	

2	Restriction on Ownership Based on the Location of Property for Domestic Firms	Restriction on ownership based the location of property for domestic firms
3	Restriction on Ownership of Agricultural Land for Domestic Firms	Restriction on ownership of agricultural land for domestic firms
4	Restriction on Ownership Based on the Type of Building for Domestic Firms	Restriction on ownership based on the type of building for domestic firms

1.3.2 Domestic Firms-Leasehold

Restrictions for domestic firms to lease properties, whether based on zoning or land use regulations, can impact the decision of a firm on where to establish a business. ¹⁹ Leasing restrictions on land can limit the ability of domestic firms to acquire a property, which can hinder their growth and development. ²⁰ Therefore, Subcategory 1.3.2–Domestic Firms–Leasehold comprises five indicators (table 10).

Table 10. Subcategory 1.3.2-Domestic Firms-Leasehold

	Indicators	Components
1	Restriction on Leasehold Based on the Area of the Land for Domestic Firms	Restriction on leasehold based on the area of the land for domestic firms
2	Restriction on the Duration of the Lease for Domestic Firms	Restriction on the duration of the lease for domestic firms
3	Restriction on Leasehold Based on the Location of Property for Domestic Firms	Restriction on leasehold based on the location of property for domestic firms
4	Restriction on Leasehold of Agricultural Land for Domestic Firms	Restriction on leasehold of agricultural land for domestic firms
5	Restriction on Leasehold Based on the Type of Building for Domestic Firms	Restriction on leasehold based on the type of building for domestic firms

1.3.3 Foreign Firms—Ownership

Economies are divided regarding foreign ownership. In most economies there are at least some kinds of restrictions on foreign ownership, whether it is on agricultural lands or residential properties. ²¹ Such restrictions can hinder the ability of foreign firms to invest in a particular country, leading to reduced economic performance, lower financial development. ²² Therefore, Subcategory 1.3.3–Foreign Firms–Ownership comprises five indicators (table 11).

Table 11. Subcategory 1.3.3-Foreign Firms-Ownership

	Indicators	Components
1	Restriction on Ownership Based on the Area of the Land for Foreign Firms	Restriction on ownership based on the area of the land for foreign firms
2	Restriction on the Duration of Ownership for Foreign Firms	Restriction on the duration of ownership for foreign firms
3	Restriction on Ownership Based on the Location of Property for Foreign Firms	Restriction on ownership based on the location of property for foreign firms
4	Restriction on Ownership of Agricultural Land for Foreign Firms	Restriction on ownership of agricultural land for foreign firms
5	Restrictions on Ownership Based on the Type of Building for Foreign Firms	Restrictions on ownership based on the type of building for foreign firms

1.3.4 Foreign Firms-Leasehold

A lease is an agreement between the owner of a property who will allow the lessee to use this property for profit.²³ Some economies have strict rules on the duration of leases, while others allow for a much longer period, usually ninety-nine years. Some other economies leave the duration of the lease to the contractual parties. Restrictions on leasing can hinder the ability of foreign firms to invest in and develop operations in a particular country.²⁴ Therefore, Subcategory 1.3.4–Foreign Firms–Leasehold comprises five indicators (table 12).

Table 12. Subcategory 1.3.4-Foreign Firms-Leasehold

	Indicators	Components
1	Restriction on Leasehold Based on the Area of the Land for Foreign Firms	Restriction on leasehold based on the area of the land for foreign firms
2	Restriction on the Duration of Lease for Foreign Firms	Restriction on the duration of lease for foreign firms
3	Restriction on Leasehold Based on the Location of Property for Foreign Firms	Restriction on leasehold based on the location of property for foreign firms
4	Restriction on leasehold of Agricultural Land for Foreign Firms	Restriction on leasehold of agricultural land for foreign firms
5	Restriction on Leasehold Based on the Type of Building for Foreign Firms	Restriction on leasehold based on the type of building for foreign firms

1.4 Environmental Permits

Category 1.4 is divided into two subcategories consisting of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, have several components.

1.4.1 Environmental Permits for Construction

Environmental permitting is a critical aspect of construction project planning and management. Studies have shown that obtaining environmental permits can be a time-consuming and complex process, requiring significant resources and expertise. ²⁵ However, environmental permits are essential to ensuring that construction projects comply with environmental regulations and standards, and that the potential impacts on the natural environment are minimized. Construction projects that require environmental permits can have significant impacts on local communities and the broader environment, and the decisions made during the environmental permitting process can have implications for sustainable development. ²⁶ The legal framework on environment governing construction projects typically defines low, moderate, or high levels of environmental risk projects based on the potential environmental impacts of the project. The categorization of projects is usually determined through an environmental review process that considers factors such as the project's location, size, and potential impact on natural resources. ²⁷ Therefore, Subcategory 1.4.1–Environmental Permits for Construction comprises thirteen indicators (table 13).

Table 13. Subcategory 1.4.1–Environmental Permits for Construction

	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
	Indicators	Components	
1	Environmental Risks as Defined by Legal Framework	Environmental risks as defined by legal framework for new construction projects	
2	Environmental Permits Requirements for Construction	 i) Permits requirement to prevent pollution (air, water, soil) during or from construction projects in the building industry ii) Permits requirement to govern extraction of water resources during or from construction projects in the building industry 	

			Permits requirements to govern waste management and recycling during or from construction projects in the building industry Permits requirement to govern wastewater treatment during or from
3	Enforcement Mechanism for Environmental Permits		construction projects in the building industry Penalties or fines in place for non-compliance with the regulations
4	Qualified Professional/Professional Agency to Conduct EIA		Qualified professional/professional agency to conduct environmental impact assessment (EIA)
5	Criteria that Trigger an EIA	i) ii) iii) iv)	Size of project Nature of industry Geographical location Environmental Impact
6	EIA for Projects with Low Environmental Impact		All projects, including those categorized as having a low environmental impact, must obtain an environmental approval by a public entity
7	Requirements for an EIA Process	iii)	Scoping and baseline studies (identification of the scope of the assessment, including issues to be addressed and the potential environmental impacts of the proposed project) (assessment of the current environmental conditions and the potential effects of the proposed project on the environment, including air and water quality, biodiversity, and socioeconomic conditions) Impact assessment (identification and evaluation of the potential positive and negative environmental impacts of the proposed project, including direct and indirect impacts, short-term and long-term impacts, and cumulative impacts) Mitigation measures (development of measures to avoid, minimize, or compensate for the negative environmental impacts of the proposed project, and enhancement of positive impacts) and alternative analysis (assessment of feasible alternatives to the proposed project, including the no-action alternative, and evaluation of their potential environmental impacts) Public participation (consultation with the public and other stakeholders to obtain their views on the proposed project and the potential environmental impacts, and consideration of their concerns and suggestions in the decision-making process) Monitoring and follow-up (implementation of a monitoring program to verify the accuracy of the impact predictions, and to ensure that the mitigation measures are effective in reducing the negative environmental impacts)
8	Legal Responsibility for Checking Compliance		Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) subject to a formal review with guidelines and procedures
9	Qualified Professional to Review EIA		Qualified professional/professional agency to conduct a formal review of environmental impact assessment (EIA)
10	Enforcement Mechanism of EIA Decisions		Penalties or fines in place for non-compliance with the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) regulations
11	Liability for Environmental Damages		Approving authority of an EIA or the project developer/owner can be held liable for environmental damages
12	Public Consultations Requirement Elements	i) ii) iii)	Ensuring that the information is provided in a language that is accessible to the intended audience Clear and accessible information in an accessible place, online, in gazettes, media, etc. Capacity buildings (training, resources, and technical assistance to stakeholders, as needed)
13	Disclosure of EIA Information		Public disclosure of relevant information from Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) mandatory by law

1.4.2 Dispute Mechanisms for Construction-Related Environmental Permits

Dispute mechanisms for environmental permits for construction can be critical in resolving conflicts that may arise during environmental clearance. Effective dispute resolution mechanisms should consider the interests of all stakeholders and seek to find a fair and equitable solution that balances environmental protection, safety in construction and economic development. Several stakeholders should be involved in these disputes, including project proponents, regulatory authorities, local communities, environmental organizations and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), and government agencies. ²⁸ Therefore,

Subcategory 1.4.2–Dispute Mechanisms for Construction-Related Environmental Permits comprises two indicators (table 14).

Table 14. Subcategory 1.4.2-Dispute Mechanisms for Construction-Related Environmental Permits

	Indicators	Components
1	Ability to Dispute Environmental Clearances and	Ability to dispute environmental clearances and permits
1	Permits	Troffing to dispute environmental electrices and permits
	Out-of-court Resolution	i) Arbitration
2	Mechanisms for Environmental	ii) Conciliation or mediation
	Disputes	

2. PILLAR II. QUALITY OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION FOR BUSINESS LOCATION

Table 15 shows the structure for Pillar II, Quality of Public Services and Transparency of Information for Business Location. Each of this pillar's categories and subcategories will be discussed in more detail in the order shown in the table.

Table 15. Pillar II-Quality of Public Services and Transparency of Information for Business Location

2.1	Availability and Reliability of Digital Services
2.1.1	Property Transfer-Digital Public Services
2.1.2	Property Transfer–Digital Land Management and Identification System
2.1.3	Property Transfer-Coverage of the Land Registry and Mapping Agency
2.1.4	Building Permits-Digital Public Services
2.1.5	Environmental Permits-Digital Public Services
2.2	Interoperability of Services
2.2.1	Interoperability of Services for Property Transfer
2.2.2	Interoperability of Services for Building Permits
2.3	Transparency of Information
2.3.1	Immovable Property (includes gender)
2.3.2	Building, Zoning and Land Use
2.3.3	Environmental Permits

2.1 Availability and Reliability of Digital Services

Category 2.1 is divided into five subcategories consisting of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, have several components.

2.1.1 Property Transfer–Digital Public Services

With internet availability in almost every country, public services can offer secure online services such as due diligence checking and property registration for real estate transactions. Digital tools can provide more accurate and efficient means of verifying the legal, financial, and physical status of a property, which can ultimately lead to better decision-making in real estate transactions.²⁹ Online portals for property transfer can provide more efficient and convenient means of completing real estate transactions, which can ultimately lead to better outcomes for buyers, sellers, and investors.³⁰ Therefore, Subcategory 2.1.1–Property Transfer–Digital Public Services comprises seven indicators (table 16).

Table 16. Subcategory 2.1.1-Property Transfer-Digital Public Services

	Indicators	Components
		i) Title search (ownership)
1	Online Due Diligence Checking	ii) Outstanding taxes (tax agency)
		iii) Bankruptcy search

		iv) Company profile
		v) Cadastral plan
		i) Liens
3	Online Due Diligence Checking –	ii) Mortgages
3	Encumbrances	iii) Easements
		iv) Restrictions
3	Single Online Platform for Due	Single online platform to conduct all the necessary due diligence checks for
3	Diligence Checking	property transfer
4	Online Platform for Property	0-1:
4	Transfer	Online platform for registering property transfer
		i) Downloading forms
_	Processes Available Online for	ii) Uploading document
3	Property Transfer	iii) Getting notifications
		iv) Processing payment
(Complaint Mechanisms for	Complete with the control of the con
6	Immovable Property Registry	Complaint mechanisms for immovable property registry
7	Complaint Mechanisms for	Complaint manifest for an in-
1	Cadaster	Complaint mechanisms for cadaster

2.1.2 Property Transfer-Digital Land Management and Identification System

In a good land management system, the institutional framework must ensure that both the land registry and the mapping system (cadaster) have adequate infrastructure to maintain land information to guarantee high standards and reduce the risk of errors. Good infrastructure is essential for the implementation of land policy and land use planning.³¹ Therefore, Subcategory 2.1.2–Property Transfer–Digital Land Management and Identification System comprises four indicators (table 17).

Table 17. Subcategory 2.1.2-Property Transfer-Digital Land Management and Identification System

~ J ~ c	, 500111		
	Indicators	Components	
1	Format of Property Title Certificates	i) Certificates are digitalized (i.e., can be modified online)ii) Certificates are digitized (i.e., scanned)	
2	Format of Cadastral Plans	i) Plans are digitalized (i.e., can be modified online)ii) Plans are digitized (i.e., scanned)	
3	Method to Conduct Cadastral Surveying	Direct (in situ surveying) Mixed (combination of in situ surveying and high-resolution pictures for each land parcel)	
4	National Database for Checking Identification	National database for checking identification of parties involved in property transactions	

2.1.3 Property Transfer-Coverage of the Land Registry and Mapping Agency

The completeness of coverage of all land and property at the immovable property registry is a crucial aspect of effective land management. The immovable property registry is a system used to record and manage information related to land and property ownership. A complete and accurate registry can help prevent disputes, fraud, and other problems related to land ownership.³² Complete or partial coverage of the immovable property registry and the mapping agency (cadaster) may influence the decision of an entrepreneur on where to locate a business. Effective land information systems ensure that the registry and the cadaster make records of all registered private land readily available, and the records cover the entire economy. Therefore, Subcategory 2.1.3–Property Transfer–Coverage of the Land Registry and Mapping Agency comprises four indicators (table 18).

Table 18. Subcategory 2.1.3–Property Transfer–Coverage of the Land Registry and Mapping Agency

-5-	57	
	Indicators	Components
1	Land Registration Coverage at National Level	Land registration coverage at national level

2	Land Registration Coverage at Main City Level	Land registration coverage at main city level
3	Cadastral Coverage at National Level	Cadastral coverage at national level
4	Cadastral Coverage at Main City Level	Cadastral coverage at main city level

2.1.4 Building Permits–Digital Public Services

Digital public services can help to reduce the time and cost associated with building permit applications, while also increasing transparency and accountability.³³ Digital building permitting services can improve communication between various stakeholders, including architects, contractors, and government officials.³⁴ Therefore, Subcategory 2.1.4–Building Permits–Digital Public Services comprises four indicators (table 19).

Table 19. Subcategory 2.1.4–Building Permits–Digital Public Services

	Indicators	Components
1	Online Platform for Issuing Building Authorizations	 i) Online platform for building authorizations and full integration of authorizations from all relevant organizations outside of the planning/building control agency ii) Online platform for building authorizations and integration of some relevant authorizations from agencies outside of the planning/building control agency (but not all)
2	Online Permitting Systems with Several Functionalities	 i) Online payment of fees ii) Online communication iii) Online notification iv) Online submission v) Auto-generated checklist
3	Online Permitting Systems to Submit Building and Occupancy Permits	Building permit can be obtained online Occupancy permit can be obtained online
4	File Dispute Online on Building Permits	Mechanism available to file a dispute online on the final decision on building permits

2.1.5 Environmental Permits–Digital Public Services

Digital public services can also improve the quality of the built environment and can help ensure that building plans meet safety, health, and environmental standards. ³⁵ Therefore, Subcategory 2.1.5–Environmental Permits–Digital Public Services comprises four indicators (table 20).

Table 20. Subcategory 2.1.5– Environmental Permits–Digital Public Services

	Indicators	Components
1	Online Permitting Systems to Facilitate Public Participation	Electronic system that facilitates public participation for environmental permitting
2	Online Permitting Systems with Several Functionalities	 i) Online payment ii) Online communication iii) Online submission iv) Auto-generated checklist
3	Paper Copies Required in Conjunction with Online Submission	When submitting the documentation for obtaining environmental permits electronically, is it also necessary to send paper copies
4	File Dispute Online on Environmental Licensing	Mechanism available to file a dispute online on the final decision on environmental licensing

2.2 Interoperability of Services

Category 2.2 is divided into two subcategories consisting of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, have several components.

2.2.1 Interoperability of Services for Property Transfer

Data exchange between the immovable property registry and the mapping agency (cadaster) ensures data accuracy and reduces the risk of mistakes in property data. Interoperability can increase the efficiency of property transactions by reducing the time and resources required to complete them, as well as enhance the accuracy and reliability of property records, which can reduce disputes and errors in property transactions³⁶. Interoperability can also help to overcome the challenges posed by fragmented land administration systems, improve the accessibility of land information, and help to overcome the challenges posed by limited resources and capacity in land administration agencies.³⁷ Therefore, Subcategory 2.2.1–Interoperability of Services for Property Transfer comprises four indicators (table 21).

Table 21. Subcategory 2.2.1-Interoperability of Services for Property Transfer

	Indicators	Components
1	Interoperability between Immovable Property Registry and Cadaster	Information recorded by the immovable property registry is shared electronically and in real time with the cadaster/mapping agency
2	Interoperability between Immovable Property Registry and other Services	Information recorded by the immovable property registry is shared electronically and in real time with other services
3	Existence of a Geographic Information System (GIS)	Existence of a Geographic Information System (GIS)
4	Existence of a Unique Identifier between Immovable Property Registry and Cadaster	Existence of a unique identifier between immovable property registry and cadaster

2.2.2 Interoperability of Services for Building Permits

Interoperability in building permits can improve the efficiency and transparency of the permitting process³⁸. Linking all relevant agencies has significant advantages as it eliminates the need to submit the same information to multiple public actors, reducing the time for the firm to obtain all the relevant information from each agency. Having an integrated Geographic Information System (GIS) can enable building departments and related agencies to streamline and automate their procedures for planning, zoning, and issuing building permits. This set of indicators assesses the exchange of information across agencies, such as municipalities, cadasters, land registries, utility service providers, fire safety agency, etc. Specifically, it assesses whether and how institutional information systems are interlinked to exchange information automatically. Therefore, Subcategory 2.2.2–Interoperability of Services for Building Permits comprises two indicators (table 22).

Table 22. Subcategory 2.2.2-Interoperability of Services for Building Permits

	Indicators	Components
	Availability of Spatial Plans and	Availability of spatial plans and zoning requirements to all stakeholders from
1	Zoning Requirements to All	the local or central information data source/digital platform such as GIS or
	Stakeholders	national spatial planning platform
2	Integration of GIS or National	Full integration of GIS or national spatial platforms between the permit-issuing
2	Spatial Platforms	agency and other stakeholder agencies

Note: GIS = Geographic Information System.

2.3 Transparency of Information

Category 2.3 is divided into three subcategories consisting of several indicators, each of which may, in turn, have several components.

2.3.1 Immovable Property (includes gender)

One of the key elements of a good land administration system is transparency as it eliminates asymmetry of information between users and the administration. Transparency in land administration is essential for

good governance and economic development, and the adoption of open data policies and make land ownership information easily accessible to the public.³⁹ When all land-related information is publicly available, all fees for public services are easily accessible, this minimizes the possibilities of informal payments.

Moreover, from a gender perspective, equal property rights are important to foster inclusive economic growth. There is a significant link between a woman's ownership of property and her increased influence in family decisions, economic advancement, and the family's ability to withstand hardships. Having secure property rights goes beyond just contributing to economic growth and the welfare of future generations. It can also be a conduit for enhancing women's empowerment and independence. As such, having sex-disaggregated data on property ownership can help reveal gender disparities in land ownership and control, and to identify opportunities for policy interventions to promote women's land rights as well help monitor progress towards gender equality in land governance. Therefore, Subcategory 2.3.1–Immovable Property (includes gender) comprises twelve indicators (table 23).

Table 23. Subcategory 2.3.1–Immovable Property (includes gender)

	Indicators	Components
1	Publication of Property Transactions Requirements	Updated information on property transactions requirements available online
2	Transparency of Property Transaction Costs	Updated information on property transactions costs available online
3	Service Standards at the Immovable Property Registry	Time to deliver a property ownership document available online
4	Transparency of Cadaster Costs	Updated information on cadastral plan costs available online
5	Service Standards for Cadaster	Time to deliver a cadastral plan available online
6	Availability of Statistics on Land Transactions	Updated statistics on number and type of land transactions available online
7	Availability of Statistics on Number and Type of Land Disputes	Updated statistics on number and type of land disputes available online
8	Availability of Sex-Disaggregated Statistics on Number and Type of Land Disputes	Sex-disaggregated statistics on number and type of land disputes available
9	Availability of Statistics on the Average Time to Resolve Land Disputes	Updated statistics on average time to resolve land disputes available online
10	Availability of Sex-Disaggregated Data on Land Ownership	Updated anonymized sex-disaggregated statistics on land ownership available online
11	Availability of Sex-Disaggregated Data on Land Ownership by Ownership Type	Sex-disaggregated statistics on land ownership differentiated by sole and/or joint proprietorship
12	Availability of Information on Property Tax Value	Information on property tax value available online

2.3.2 Building, Zoning and Land Use

Transparency in building permit systems is essential for promoting fair competition, ensuring compliance with safety and environmental regulations, facilitating the use of new technologies, improving the efficiency and effectiveness of the permitting process, and promoting economic growth and development. ⁴² In the realm of urban development, the interplay between building, zoning, and land use is pivotal. Ensuring public accessibility to planning and building control regulations is a cornerstone of transparent governance. This transparency extends to the public online availability of requirements for obtaining all types of building-related permits, as well as those needed to secure an occupancy permit. Moreover, it is essential that applicable fee schedules for construction are not only publicly available but also regularly updated to

reflect current standards. To facilitate informed decision-making, official statistics on the issuance of building permits should be updated and readily accessible online. Lastly, the city's master plan, including zoning, must be current and available for public scrutiny, with clear procedures outlined for any proposed modifications to zoning or land use plans, ensuring strict adherence to established zoning regulations. Therefore, Subcategory 2.3.2–Building, Zoning and Land Use comprises eight indicators (table 24).

Table 24. Subcategory 2.3.2-Building, Zoning and Land Use

	Indicators	Components
1	Public Accessibility of Planning and Building Control Regulations	Building control regulations, accessible to all stakeholders, including residents, developers, architects, and other interested parties
2	Public Online Availability of Requirements to Obtain All Types of Building Related Permit	Detailed criteria and steps necessary to obtain building permits List of approvals required prior to obtaining a building permit from local service providers List of documents required to apply for a building permit
3	Public Online Availability of Requirements Needed to Obtain Occupancy Permit	List of documents required to apply for an occupancy permit
4	Applicable Fee Schedules for All Types of Construction Publicly Available and Up to Date	Applicable fee schedules for all types of construction publicly available and up to date
5	Availability of Official, Updated and Publicly Available Online Statistics Tracking the Number of Issued Building Permits	Official, updated statistics tracking the number of building permits
6	Updated City Master Plan/Zoning Plan	Updated city master plan/zoning plan
7	Steps to Modify Zoning/Land Use Plan	Steps to modify zoning/land use plan
8	Adherence to Zoning Regulations	Adherence to zoning regulations verified before submitting a building permit application

2.3.3 Environmental Permits

Transparency in environmental licenses ushers a new standard in environmental governance, particularly in the context of construction projects with moderate environmental risk. A key aspect of this governance is the public online availability of requirements for obtaining environmental licensing, which empowers stakeholders by providing clear, accessible information. Equally important is the maintenance of an up-to-date fee schedule for all types of environmental clearances, ensuring that applicants are aware of the financial implications of compliance. Therefore, Subcategory 2.3.3–Environmental Permits comprises three indicators (table 25).

Table 25. Subcategory 2.3.3–Environmental Permits

	Indicators	Components
	Public Online Availability of	i) Available online and updated
1	Environmental Licensing	ii) Available online but not updated
1	Requirements for Moderate-Risk	iii) Not available online
	Construction Project	iv) Available in paper format
	Applicable and Up to Date Fee	
2	Schedule for Environmental	Current fee schedule applicable for environmental permits is available online
	Clearances	
	Availability of Official, Updated	Public, official and updated information shows a list or total number of
3	and Publicly Available List of	approved EIAs
	approved EIAs	approved ETAs

Note: EIA = Environmental Impact Assessment

3. PILLAR III. OPERATIONAL EFFICIENCY OF ESTABLISHING A BUSINESS LOCATION

Table 26 shows the structure for Pillar III, Operational Efficiency of Establishing a Business Location. Each of this pillar's categories and subcategories will be discussed in more detail in the order shown in the table.

Table 26. Pillar III-Operational Efficiency of Establishing a Business Location

3.1	Property Transfer and Land Administration
3.1.1	Major Constraints on Access to Land
3.1.2	Time to Transfer a Property
3.1.3	Cost to Transfer a Property
3.2	Construction Permits
3.2.1	Time to Obtain a Construction-Related Permit
3.2.2	Time to Obtain a Building Permit
3.2.3	Cost to Obtain a Building Permit
3.3	Environmental Permit
3.3.1	Time to Obtain an Environmental Permit
3.3.2	Cost to Obtain an Environmental Permit

3.1 Property Transfer and Land Administration

Category 3.1 is divided into three subcategories consisting of one indicator each.

3.1.1 Major Constraints on Access to Land

Secure access to land poses a significant hurdle for firms, acting as a bottleneck to their growth and operations. This uncertainty can deter investments, stifle development projects, and impede the expansion of businesses, particularly in sectors such as agriculture, manufacturing, and real estate. ⁴³ Therefore, Subcategory 3.1.1–Major Constraints on Access to Land comprises one indicator (table 27).

Table 27. Subcategory 3.1.1-Major Constraints on Access to Land

	Indicators	Components
1	Major Constraints on Access to Land	Perceptions index of access to land as a constraint

3.1.2 Time to Transfer a Property

The time taken to obtain property transfer varies from country to country and can depend on various factors such as the complexity of the property transaction, the efficiency of the legal system, and the availability of resources such as surveyors, appraisers, and land registry offices. The timeliness in which a change of ownership is processed is important for businesses as this can lead to delays in starting their business. Having an efficient conveyancing system in place, where bottlenecks are assessed on a regular basis, is important to avoid delays in property transactions. ⁴⁴ Therefore, Subcategory 3.1.2–Time to Transfer a Property comprises one indicator (table 28).

Table 28. Subcategory 3.1.2-Time to Transfer a Property

4		the contract of the contract o						
		Indicators	Components					
	1	Time to Transfer a Property	The period in calendar days to complete the entire process to transfer the ownership of a commercial property from one domestic company to another domestic company					

3.1.3 Cost to Transfer a Property

Cumbersome processes and high fees, such as transfer tax, registration fees or stamp duties can discourage people from registering the transfer of property. It can also lead to reduced revenue collected by government from property taxation if high cost discourages property registration. Reducing the cost of transferring

property ownership is essential for promoting transparency, competition, and innovation and for reducing corruption. ⁴⁵ Therefore, Subcategory 3.1.3–Cost to Transfer a Property comprises one indicator (table 29).

Table 29. Subcategory 3.1.3-Cost to Transfer a Property

	Indicators	Components
1	Cost to Transfer a Property	Includes all administrative costs incurred by the firm to transfer ownership of a property from a buyer to a seller, including fees, transfer taxes, stamp duties and any other payment to the property registry, notaries, public agencies, or lawyers

3.2 Construction Permits

Category 3.2 is divided into three subcategories consisting of one indicator each.

3.2.1 Time to Obtain a Construction-Related Permit

The speed of obtaining construction-related permits directly impacts business operations and investment decisions. Lengthy and cumbersome permit procedures can delay construction projects, leading to increased costs, missed deadlines, and potential disruptions to business activities. Conversely, shorter permit processing times can enhance the attractiveness of a location for investment, encouraging firms to allocate resources more efficiently and stimulating economic growth. Time to Obtain a Construction-Related Permit indicator shows the average number of days it takes to receive a construction-related permit from the time an establishment applies for it until it is granted. Therefore, Subcategory 3.2.1–Time to Obtain a Construction-Related Permit comprises one indicator (table 30).

Table 30. Subcategory 3.2.1-Time to Obtain a Construction-Related Permit

	Indicators	Components
1	Time to Obtain a Construction- Related Permit	The period in calendar days between the time the application was completed and submitted and the time it was granted. These permits refer to both those related to the expansion or construction of the establishment's premises and to permits required in order to carry out construction work for clients

3.2.2 Time to Obtain a Building Permit

There can be significant variation in the time required to obtain building permits and this depends on numerous factors such as existing backlogs of applications to be processed, scarce resources to process these applications or excessive requirements to submit these applications (such as too many required inspections). ⁴⁶ Tackling this issue is important as more efficient processing of building permits can have positive impact on economic growth and development, by increasing investment and employment opportunities. Therefore, Subcategory 3.2.2–Time to Obtain a Building Permit comprises one indicator (table 31).

Table 31. Subcategory 3.2.2-Time to Obtain a Building Permit

	Indicators	Components
1	Time to Obtain a Building Permit	The period in calendar days to complete the entire process to obtain a building permit for a commercial property-office building type

3.2.3 Cost to Obtain a Building Permit

Lowering the cost of building permits can have significant positive impacts on the construction industry and the broader economy. By reducing the financial burden of obtaining permits, more construction projects can be initiated and completed, leading to increased job opportunities and economic growth. Additionally, lower permit costs can encourage the development of affordable housing and other infrastructure projects that benefit communities, including helping firms choose an appropriate location for their business operations.⁴⁷ Therefore, Subcategory 3.2.3–Cost to Obtain a Building Permit has one indicator (table 32).

Table 32. Subcategory 3.2.3-Cost to Obtain a Building Permit

	Indicators	Components
1	Cost to Obtain a Building Permit	Includes all costs incurred by the firm to obtain a building permit, including obtaining any required land use approvals and preconstruction design clearances, building permit fees

3.3 Environmental Permit

Category 3.3 is divided into two subcategories consisting of one indicator each.

3.3.1 Time to Obtain an Environmental Permit

Establishing clear and transparent environmental permit procedures can help reduce the time to obtain environmental permits, which is essential for promoting sustainable development. ⁴⁸ Delays in environmental permits can significantly increase project costs and result in economic losses. Therefore, Subcategory 3.3.1–Time to Obtain Environmental Permit comprises one indicator (table 33).

Table 33. Subcategory 3.3.1-Time to Obtain an Environmental Permit

	Indicators	Components
1	Time to Obtain an Environmental	The period in calendar days to complete all steps to obtain environmental
1	Permit	licenses

3.3.2 Cost to Obtain an Environmental Permit

High cost of environmental permitting can have a significant impact on the economy and on businesses, impacting project feasibility and investment decisions. In addition, high permitting costs can discourage investment in environmental innovation, as well as making it more difficult for businesses to invest in and adopt new environmental technologies. ⁴⁹ Therefore, Subcategory 3.3.2—Cost to Obtain an Environmental Permit comprises one indicator (table 34).

Table 34. Subcategory 3.3.2–Cost to Obtain an Environmental Permit

	Indicators	Components
1	Cost to Obtain an Environmental Permit	Includes all costs incurred by the firm to obtain the environmental permit

III. DATA SOURCES

4.1 Data Collection Sources

The data for Pillar I and Pillar II are collected through consultations with private sector experts. Private sector experts include lawyers and practitioners working in the areas of property transfer, building permitting, and environmental permitting such as property lawyers, notaries, conveyancers, architects, engineers, environmental consultants, environmental engineers, and environmental planners.

The data for Pillar III are collected through consultation with private sector experts and Enterprise Surveys (ES). The ES provides representative data on major constraints on access to land and the time to obtain construction-related permits, as experienced by businesses in practice. A representative sample of companies captures the variation of user experience within each economy. Businesses with different characteristics, such as size, region, and sector participate in the surveys. For more details on the collection of data by the ES, please refer to the Overview Chapter of this Methodology Handbook.

The data on time and cost to transfer property, to obtain a building permit, and to obtain an environmental permit are collected through consultation with private sector experts. The reason for this approach is the

limited experience that firms surveyed by Enterprise Surveys are expected to have with processes that do not occur on a regular basis for most companies (such as submitting building permits). Finally, broad parameters are defined (as described in Section IV below) to ensure data comparability across economies.

4.2 Screening and Selection of Experts

The Business Location topic has three questionnaires, one for each area: Property Transfer, Building Permits, and Environmental Permits. Each questionnaire targets experts in their respective areas of expertise. A screener questionnaire is used to assist the selection of experts receiving the Business Location topic questionnaires based on a set of criteria (table 35).

Table 35. Screener Questionnaire and Respondent Criteria

able 55. Screener Questionnaire and Respondent Criteria					
Relevant Experts' Profession	IS Control of the con				
Property Transfer	Property lawyers, notaries, conveyancers				
Building Permits	Architects, engineers, construction lawyers				
Environmental Permits	Environmental consultants, environmental engineers, and environmental planners				
Relevant Areas of Specializa	tion				
Property Transfer	Property law, notarial services, conveyancing				
Building Permits	Architecture, civil engineering, construction contracting, construction law				
Environmental Permits	Environmental law, environmental engineering, environmental planning				
Assessment of the Experts	Knowledge and Experience Related to Property Transfer, Building Permitting and				
Environmental Permitting a	nd Related Regulations, Services, and Processes				
Property Transfer	Experience with preparing contracts of purchase and sale of property, conducting commercial property transactions, conducting property registrations at land registry/immovable property registry, contacting tax authorities for property transaction-related taxes (transfer tax, stamp duty, etc.); engagement with complaint mechanisms for property transfer services; as well as knowledge of the regulations affecting property transfer				
Building Permits	Experience with obtaining all necessary pre-approvals and submitting applications for building permits with the building control agency or municipality; awareness of building code provisions, building permitting fees; engagement; and knowledge of the regulations affecting building control				
Environmental Permits	Experience with obtaining environmental clearances and permits related new construction projects, preparing and submitting Environmental Impact Assessments, awareness of environmental laws and regulations, awareness of complaint mechanisms for environmental permitting				

Thus, the information provided in the screener questionnaires allows the team to better understand the experts' professions, areas of specialization, and knowledge or experience related to property transfer, building permitting, and environmental permitting.

IV. PARAMETERS

To ensure comparability of the data from expert consultations across economies, the Business Location topic uses general and specific parameters. A parameter refers to an assumption that is made about the characteristics of a location, the type and size of a construction project and the value of a property.

5.1 General Parameters

Property Transfer, Building Permitting, and Environmental Permitting employ a common general parameter of location. Many economies have subnational jurisdictions (such as the state level), which require a specific business location to be specified for experts to identify the relevant regulatory framework to be assessed.

5.1.1 Business Location

Justification:

Geographic location determines the relevant regulatory framework governing building and environmental permits. In many economies, legislation governing building and environmental permits is defined at city and municipal level. For property transfer, building permits, and environmental permits, geographical location determines which municipality, agency, or registry provides the permitting services. Some restrictions might be imposed on construction and on property ownership and leasehold (both for domestic and foreign firms) depending on location. Environmental clearances are also affected by the location of the property being developed. Thus, business location is an essential parameter for assessing the efficiency of obtaining a business location. The largest city is chosen based on the population size, as detailed in the Overview chapter of this Methodology Handbook.

Application:

For Pillar I, the business location parameter is used in cases where regulations are not applicable at the national level but vary across states or regions. For the economies where regulations differ across states, regulations for the largest city (by population) are measured. For Pillar II, the parameter is used to determine the relevant municipality involved in providing building permitting services and the relevant agency involved in providing environmental clearances for construction projects. For Pillar III, this parameter applies to data collected through expert consultations rather than through enterprise surveys. Specifically, the parameter is relevant for measures on time and cost to transfer property, a building permit and an environmental permit as they can vary significantly across cities.

5.2 Specific Parameters

Some specific parameters are also necessary to ensure that estimates provided by experts with regard to the transfer of property, to obtaining building-related permits or environmental permits in construction, are comparable across economies. Obtaining such estimates can vary widely depending on the value of property (for transfer of property); type and size of building (for building permits); type and size of housing development (for environmental permits).

5.2.1 Value of Property

Justification:

For property transfer and building permits, a specific parameter of the value of property or construction cost is used to be able to compute time and cost indicators. The value of the property or the construction cost is required to calculate transfer tax, registration fees, and stamp duties in several jurisdictions. For example, in South Africa the amount of transfer duty paid is based on the value of the property being transferred and is calculated using a sliding scale of property tax. In Ghana, the amount of stamp duty paid is based on the value of the property being transferred and is calculated using a fixed rate.

Building permit fees are often based on the value of the construction project. In many cases, the fees are calculated as a percentage of the estimated construction costs. Knowing the value of the property allows the building department to accurately assess the estimated cost of the construction project and apply the appropriate fee. Considering the example of Australia, building permit fees are based on the value of the construction project: in Sydney, the Building and Development Advisory Service provides a fee calculator tool that allows users to estimate the cost of building permit fees based on the value of the construction project. Put simply, the rationale behind setting a value of property is to ensure data comparability across all surveyed economies.

Application:

Pillar III of the Business Location topic for Building Permitting and Property Transfer assumes the value of property or construction cost to be 100 times gross national income (GNI) per capita. This value will be

provided as an equivalent in local currency of each economy. In the absence of reliable data on property or construction values across all economies, GNI per capita multiplied by 100 is suggested to approximate these values based on respective affordability rates.

5.2.2 Largest Municipality

Justification:

In some cities, there could be one or several municipalities. The Business Location topic, and building permitting in particular, aim to capture the most common practice; hence, the largest municipality in the largest city is considered (in terms of customers served or market share).

Application:

The parameter of the largest municipality in the largest city is relevant to all measures of Pillar II and Pillar III for building permitting because provision of building permits varies depending on the municipality. For Pillar III, the parameter applies to measures on time and cost as efficiency of obtaining a building permit may vary depending on the municipality.

5.2.3 Type and Size of Building

Justification:

To make the data comparable across economies for building permitting, the type and size of building are used as a unit of measurement. Building regulations vary depending on the type of construction being permitted—typically classified as residential, commercial, or industrial. The type and level of pre-approvals and the type of documents to be submitted, as well as the associated regulatory costs, vary with type of construction (for example, residential buildings usually require fewer technical plans, documents, fewer pre-approvals, and lower fees). Regulatory aspects, like technical inspections mandated by law, are also usually governed by the type of construction in question. The size of building affects the cost of permitting. In some cases, it can affect the number of inspections to be conducted during construction, which is often calculated as a fixed fee per square meter/foot or cubic meter. For example, in Singapore, Thailand, and the United Kingdom, fees to obtain building and occupancy permits are based on a fixed fee per square meter/foot or cubic meter. In Jordan, the fees for building permits are calculated based on the number of floors. The size of the building can also affect the fees in property transactions. For example, in Albania local fees are calculated based on the size of the building.

Application:

Pillar III of the Business Location topic for Building Permitting provides specific parameters about the type of building being considered, and its size, and height for the purposes of comparison:

- Type of building: commercial building—in particular, an office building.
- Size of commercial building: 1800 square meters (19,375 square feet)⁵².
 - Computed assuming 5 floors and 360 square meters per floor (3875 square feet).
- Building height: 5 floors, with each floor assumed to be 3 meters (9 ft and 10 inches) high.

5.2.4 Type and Size of Project

Justification:

Environmental clearances and permit requirements vary depending on the size and location of the project, as well as its potential impact on the environment. Establishing clear and transparent criteria for triggering environmental clearances can help to ensure that all relevant projects are subject to the same scrutiny and can increase public trust and confidence in the clearance process. ⁵³ For example, the environmental impact assessment and audit regulations in Tanzania require an environmental impact assessment study to be conducted for projects that are above certain sizes and include housing developments. The threshold for when an EIA is required in Tanzania for housing developments is more than 50 housing units or more than 2 hectares of land. ⁵⁴

The size and type of a project can lead to increased stormwater runoff, changes to the hydrology of nearby water bodies, or potential contamination of groundwater resources. Many jurisdictions therefore require developers to obtain permits or approvals related to water quality and management as part of the environmental review process for new construction projects.⁵⁵ In addition, construction projects may have an adverse impact on water resources, particularly in areas with high planned residential density, highlighting the need for effective environmental permitting requirements to protect water quality in these areas.

Application:

Pillar I and Pillar III of the Business Location topic for Environmental Permitting provide specific parameters for the construction of a housing development project:

- Total surface area of residential housing development project: 10 acres (40,468 sqm).
- Type of residence: Detached single-family house with 1, 2, and 3 bedrooms, each with its own driveway.
- Estimated number of houses: 100 single-family homes.
- Estimated number of residents in the housing project: 600.⁵⁶

V. TOPIC SCORING

The Business Location topic has three pillars: Pillar I—Quality of Regulations for Business Location; Pillar II—Quality of Public Services and Transparency of Information for Business Location, and Pillar III—Operational Efficiency of Establishing a Business Location. The total points for each pillar are further rescaled to values from 0 to 100, and subsequently aggregated into the total topic score. Each pillar contributes one-third to the total topic score. Table 36 shows the scoring for the Business Location topic. The scores distinguish between benefits to the firm (captured as firm flexibility points) and benefits to society's broader interests (captured as social benefits points). For further scoring details, please see Annex A, which complements this section.

Table 36. Aggregate Scoring Overview

				Score	ъ		
Pillar Number	Pillar	Number of Indicators	Firm Flexibility Points	Social Benefits Points	Total Points	Rescaled Points (0-100)	Weight
Ι	Quality of Regulations for Business Location	66	48	47	95	100	0.33
II	Quality of Public Services and Transparency of Information for Business Location	52	52	52	104	100	0.33
III	Operational Efficiency of Establishing a Business Location	8	100	n/a	100	100	0.33

Note: n/a = not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent).

6.1 Pillar I-Quality of Regulations for Business Location

Pillar I covers 66 indicators with a total score of 95 points (48 points on firm flexibility and 47 points on social benefits) (table 37). The scoring for each category under this pillar is as follows:

6.1.1 <u>Property Transfer and Land Administration</u> has 12 indicators with a total maximum score of 24 points (12 points on firm flexibility and 12 points on social benefits). Specifically, this category has three subcategories. The *Property Transfer Standards* Subcategory has 4 indicators. The *Land Dispute Mechanisms* Subcategory has 4 indicators. The *Land Administration System* Subcategory has 4 indicators. A regulatory framework that ensures efficiency of land administration systems

- and effective dispute resolution mechanisms benefits both firms (firm flexibility) and society/customers (social benefits). Hence, equal points are assigned to both categories.
- 6.1.2 <u>Building, Zoning and Land Use</u> has 20 indicators with a total maximum score of 35 points (15 points on firm flexibility and 20 points on social benefits). Specifically, the *Building Standards* Subcategory has 12 indicators; the *Building Energy Standards* Subcategory has 3 indicators; the *Zoning and Land Use Regulations* Subcategory has 5 indicators. Some measures under this category have either a neutral impact on firms, or an ambiguous impact and hence are not scored.
- 6.1.3 <u>Restrictions on Owning and Leasing Property</u> has 19 indicators with a total maximum score of 19 points (19 points on firm flexibility and 0 on social benefits). Specifically, this category has 4 subcategories: the *Domestic Firms—Ownership* Subcategory has 4 indicators; the *Domestic Firms—Leasehold* Subcategory has 5 indicators; and the *Foreign Firms—Leasehold* Subcategory has 5 indicators. A regulatory framework that imposes restrictions on lease or ownership of property can create obstacles to developing a business. Therefore, it is important to eliminate such barriers to promote a flexible environment for firms (firm flexibility). On the other hand, the short-term impact of such restriction on society is ambiguous (social benefits). Hence, points are only assigned to firm flexibility.
- 6.1.4 <u>Environmental Permits</u> has 15 indicators with a total maximum score of 17 points (2 points on firm flexibility and 15 points on social benefits). Specifically, this category has 2 subcategories; the *Environmental Permits for Construction* Subcategory has 13 indicators, and the *Dispute Mechanisms for Construction-Related Environmental Permits* Subcategory has 2 indicators. The positive impact for society is derived from enhanced environmental sustainability and improved adherence to environmental standards. Some measures under this category have either a neutral impact on firms, or an ambiguous impact and hence are not scored.

Table 37. Aggregate Scoring Pillar I

Pillar I	-Quality of Regulations for Business Location	No. of Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points	Rescaled Points
1.1	Property Transfer and Land Administration	12	12	12	24	40.00
1.1.1	Property Transfer Standards	4	4	4	8	15.00
1.1.2	Land Dispute Mechanism	4	4	4	8	10.00
1.1.3	Land Administration System	4	4	4	8	15.00
1.2	Building, Zoning and Land Use	20	15	20	35	40.00
1.2.1	Building Standards	12	10	12	22	15.00
1.2.2	Building Energy Standards	3	n/a	3	3	15.00
1.2.3	Zoning and Land Use Regulations	5	5	5	10	10.00
1.3	Restrictions on Owning and Leasing Property	19	19	n/a	19	10.00
1.3.1	Domestic Firms-Ownership	4	4	n/a	4	2.50
1.3.2	Domestic Firms–Leasehold	5	5	n/a	5	2.50
1.3.3	Foreign Firms-Ownership	5	5	n/a	5	2.50
1.3.4	Foreign Firms-Leasehold	5	5	n/a	5	2.50
1.4	Environmental Permits	15	2	15	17	10.00
1.4.1	Environmental Permits for Construction	13	n/a	13	13	5.00
1.4.2	Dispute Mechanisms for Construction-Related Environmental Permits	2	2	2	4	5.00
	Total	66	48	47	95	100.00

Note: n/a= not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent). FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

6.2 Pillar II-Quality of Public Services and Transparency of Information for Business Location

Pillar II covers 52 indicators with a total score of 104 points (52 points on firm flexibility and 52 points on social benefits) (table 38). The scoring for each category under the pillar is as follows:

- 6.2.1 <u>Availability and Reliability of Digital Services</u> has 23 indicators with a total maximum score of 46 points (23 points on firm flexibility and 23 points on social benefits). Specifically, the *Property Transfer–Digital Public Services* Subcategory has 7 indicators; the *Property Transfer–Digital Land Management and Identification System* Subcategory has 4 indicators; the *Property Transfer–Coverage of the Land Registry and Mapping Agency* Subcategory has 4 indicators; the *Building Permits–Digital Public Services* has 4 indicators and the *Environmental Permits–Digital Public Services* Subcategory has 4 indicators. Availability of online services for property transactions, building permitting and environmental permitting increases efficiency and supports public accountability, therefore extending benefits to firms (firm flexibility) and society as a whole (social benefits). Hence, equal points are assigned to both categories.
- 6.2.2 <u>Interoperability of Services</u> has 6 indicators with a total maximum score of 12 points (6 points on firm flexibility and 6 points on social benefits). Specifically, the *Interoperability of Services for Property Transfer* Subcategory has 4 indicators; and the *Interoperability of Services for Building Permits* Subcategory has 2 indicators. A regulatory framework that promotes the integration and compatibility of different systems and services related land administration and building control services provides for greater transparency and efficiency of services and benefits both firms (firm flexibility) and society (social benefits). Hence, equal points are assigned to both categories.
- 6.2.3 <u>Transparency of Information</u> has 23 indicators with a total maximum score of 46 points (23 points on firm flexibility and 23 on social benefits). Specifically, the *Immovable Property (includes gender)* Subcategory has 12 indicators; the *Building, Zoning and Land Use* Subcategory has 8 indicators; and the *Environmental Permits* Subcategory has 3 indicators. A regulatory framework that ensures transparency of land administration, building control and environmental permitting services provides firms with clarity and predictability regarding the rules and regulations they need to comply with, which in turn allows them to operate with greater flexibility and adaptability. This can result in increased innovation, competitiveness, and profitability for businesses, which benefits both firms (firm flexibility) and society (social benefits). Hence, equal points are assigned to both categories.

Table 38. Aggregate Scoring Pillar II

Table	able 58. Aggregate Scoring Pinar II							
	II—Quality of Public Services and Transparency ormation for Business Location	No. of Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points	Rescaled Points		
2.1	Availability and Reliability of Digital Services	23	23	23	46	40.00		
2.1.1	Property Transfer-Digital Public Services	7	7	7	14	12.00		
2.1.2	Property Transfer–Digital Land Management and Identification System	4	4	4	8	6.00		
2.1.3	Property Transfer–Coverage of the Land Registry and Mapping Agency	4	4	4	8	6.00		
2.1.4	Building Permits-Digital Public Services	4	4	4	8	8.00		
2.1.5	Environmental Permits- Digital Public Services	4	4	4	8	8.00		
2.2	Interoperability of Services	6	6	6	12	20.00		
2.2.1	Interoperability of Services for Property Transfer	4	4	4	8	10.00		
2.2.2	Interoperability of Services for Building Permits	2	2	2	4	10.00		

2.3	Transparency of Information	23	23	23	46	40.00
2.3.1	Immovable Property (includes gender)	12	12	12	24	20.00
2.3.2	Building, Zoning and Land Use	8	8	8	16	15.00
2.3.3	Environmental Permits	3	3	3	6	5.00
	Total	52	52	52	104	100.00

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

6.3 Pillar III-Operational Efficiency of Establishing a Business Location

Pillar III covers 8 indicators with scores ranging from 0 to 100 on firm flexibility (table 39). The scores on indicators under this pillar are assigned to firm flexibility only, as the indicators measure the outcomes of service provision to firms. For example, high fees and long times to transfer a property or to obtain building and environmental permits have adverse impacts on firms, thus reducing the firm flexibility score. The scoring for each category under this pillar is as follows:

- 6.3.1 <u>Property Transfer and Land Administration</u> has 3 indicators with a total maximum score of 40 points. Specifically, the *Major Constraints on Access to Land* Subcategory has 1 indicator, the *Time to Transfer a Property* Subcategory has 1 indicator and the *Cost to Transfer a Property* Subcategory has 1 indicator.
- 6.3.2 <u>Construction Permits</u> has 3 indicators with a total maximum score of 40 points. Specifically, the *Time to Obtain a Construction-Related Permit* Subcategory has 1 indicator, the *Time to Obtain a Building Permit* Subcategory has 1 indicator and the *Cost to Obtain a Building Permit* Subcategory has 1 indicator.
- **6.3.3** <u>Environmental Permits</u> has 2 indicators with a total maximum score of 20 points. Specifically, the *Time to Obtain an Environmental Permit* Subcategory has 1 indicator and the *Cost to Obtain an Environmental Permit* Subcategory has 1 indicator.

Table 39. Aggregate Scoring Pillar III

Pillar III–Operational Efficiency of Establishing a Business Location		No. of Indicators	Rescaled Points	
3.1	Property Transfer and Land Administration	3	40.00	
3.1.1	Major Constraints on Access to Land	1	13.33	
3.1.2	Time to Transfer a Property	1	13.33	
3.1.3	Cost to Transfer a Property	1	13.33	
3.2	Construction Permits	3	40.00	
3.2.1	Time to Obtain a Construction-Related Permit	1	13.33	
3.2.2	Time to Obtain a Building Permit	1	13.33	
3.2.3	Cost to Obtain a Building Permit	1	13.33	
3.3	Environmental Permit	2	20.00	
3.3.1	Time to Obtain an Environmental Permit	1	10.00	
3.3.2	Cost to Obtain an Environmental Permit	1	10.00	
	Total	8	100.00	

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

References

- Adenuga, A. H., C. Jack, and R. McCarry. 2021. "The Case for Long-Term Land Leasing: A Review of the Empirical Literature." *Land* 10 (3): 1–21.
- Amadi-Echendu, A. P., and R. Pellissier. 2014. "Eliminating Bottlenecks in the South African Conveyancing Environment." *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences* 5 (5). doi:10.5901/mjss. 2014.v5n14p97.
- Anhuforom, A. A., and A. T. Awoyemi. 2016. "Environmental Impact Assessment in Africa: Progress, Prospects and Challenges." *Journal of Environmental Management* 183: 448–60. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2016.08.068.
- Babatunde, O. T., R. O. Yusuf, and E. B. Ogunbode. 2016. "Planning for Infrastructure Service Access in Nigerian Cities: An Overview of Policy and Practice." *Habitat International* 53: 156–66.
- Bennison, D. J. 2006. "Developing Effective Property Transaction Standards." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 24 (3): 216–35.
- Boonyabancha, S., R. Singhadej, and S. Dhanapal. 2017. "A GIS-based Approach to Land Use Planning for Hazardous Facilities: A Case Study of Rayong Province, Thailand." *Habitat International* 62: 61–70.
- Carlson, V. 2000. "Studying Firm Locations: Survey Responses vs. Econometric Models." *Journal of Regional Analysis and Policy* 30 (1): 1–22.
- Charalambous, E., E. Cimren, and S. Bano. 2018. "Digitalisation of Building Permitting Procedures in EU Cities." European Parliament.
- Dasgupta, P., and A. Singh. 2006. "Ownership Structure, Corporate Governance, and Firm Performance: Evidence from India." *Journal of Corporate Finance* 12 (4): 645–59.
- Davis, R., and T. Barlow. 2017. "Key Elements of Effective Zoning Regulations." *Journal of the American Planning Association* 83 (3): 236–48.
- Deininger, K. and G. Feder. 1996. "Property Registration and Title Systems in Developing Countries." Policy Research Working Paper 1610. World Bank, Washington, DC.
- Deininger, K., and G. Feder. 2009. "Land Registration, Governance, and Development: Evidence and Implications for Policy." World Bank Research Observer 24 (2).
- Deininger, K., and H. Selod. 2012. "Strengthening Land Governance: Lessons Learned and Best Practices from Country Experiences." *World Bank Research Observer* 27 (2): 142–67.
- De Soto, H. 2000. The Mystery of Capital: Why Capitalism Triumphs in the West and Fails Everywhere Else. New York: Basic Books.
- FAO (Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations). 2013. "Women's Land Rights as a Pathway to Poverty Reduction: A Framework and Review of Available Evidence." FAO, Rome.

- Field, E. 2007. "Entitled to Work: Urban Property Rights and Labor Supply in Peru." *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 122 (4): 1561–1602.
- Gao, X., H. Chen, Y. Li, X. Li, and X. Deng. 2020. "Property Risk Identification Based on Machine Learning Algorithm in Due Diligence Process." *International Journal of Computational Intelligence Systems* 13 (1): 387–97.
- Garrido, A., D. Tapia, and C. Vergara. 2019. "Compliance with Energy Codes in Buildings: A Review of International Experiences and Insights for Latin America." *Energy and Buildings* 198: 221–32.
- Gathii, J. T. 2013. "Comparative Land Tenure and Property Rights Systems in Africa." *Journal of African Law* 57 (2): 221–40.
- Ghosh, Shibani. 2013. "Demystifying the Environmental Clearance Process in India." 6 NUJS Law Review 3: 433–80.
- Golub, S. 2003, "Measures of Restrictions on Inward Foreign Direct Investment for OECD Countries." OECD Economics Department Working Paper No. 357, OECD Publishing, Paris.
- Green, A., and C. Moser. 2013. "Do Property Rights Institutions Matter at the Local Level? Evidence from Madagascar." *Journal of Development Studies* 49 (1): 95–109.
- Grunwald, S., P. Bendt, and J. Kopfmüller. 2016. "Environmental Permits as an Instrument for Sustainable Planning and Decision Making in Infrastructure Projects." *Environmental Impact Assessment Review* 60: 85–93.
- Gupta, M., and P. Bansal. 2014. "Environmental Impact Assessment of Construction Projects: A Comparative Analysis of the Legal Frameworks in India and the United States." *Journal of Environmental Management* 134: 57–66.
- Gupta, A., R. Dunning, and P. McAllister. 2020. "Online Conveyancing Portals in the UK: Benefits and Limitations." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 38 (3): 268–82.
- Halpern, P., and J. Lutz. 2014. "Land Leasing and Land Use Dynamics in Developing Country Cities." *Land Use Policy* 36: 330–37.
- Hodge, T. R., and M. Greve. 2017. "Zoning, Land Use Planning, and the Local Economy." *Journal of Planning Literature* 32 (1): 3–14.
- Haltom, R. A., and R. Tanimoto. 2017. "Gender and Performance in the US Real Estate Industry." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 35 (2): 154–71.
- IBA (International Bar Association). 2019. "Transparency in Land Ownership: A Guide to Good Practice." International Bar Association.
- IFC (International Finance Corporation), World Bank, and MIGA (Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency). 2013. *Good Practices for Construction Regulation and Enforcement Reform: Guidelines for Reformers*. Washington, DC: World Bank Group.
- ILC (International Land Coalition). 2017. "Improving Land Governance through Interoperability." Briefing Paper.

- https://www.landcoalition.org/sites/default/files/documents/resources/ILC_Interoperability_Briefing Paper 2017 0.pdf.
- ILO (International Labour Organization. 2018. "Women in Construction: The State of the Evidence on Drivers, Impacts and Solutions." https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---emp_ent/---ifp_seed/documents/publication/wcms_644392.pdf.
- Johnson, S., J. McMillan, and C. Woodruff. 2002. "Property Rights and Finance." *American Economic Review* 92 (5, December): 1335–56.
- Kuprenas, J. A., and G. E. Chalmers. 1999. "Occupancy Permit Issuance: A Comparative Study." *Journal of Construction Engineering and Management* 125 (4): 283–87.
- Lee, S., J. Lee, and K. Lee. 2014. "The Effects of Ownership and Capital Structure on Performance: Evidence from Korean Firms." *Asia-Pacific Journal of Financial Studies* 43 (2): 177–202.
- Liao, R., and D. Zhang. 2016. "Property Rights, Investment Incentives, and Foreign Direct Investment." Journal of Comparative Economics 44 (4): 1088–1104.
- Linnenberg, T., T. Gür, and T. Gür. 2020. "Digitalisation of Building Permits: Perspectives and Approaches from Selected European Countries." *Journal of European Real Estate Research* 13 (3): 247–63.
- Mitincu, C-G, I-C Ioja, C-A Hossu, M. Artmann, A. Nita, and Mi-R Nita. 2021. "Licensing Sustainability-related Aspects in Strategic Environmental Assessment. Evidence from Romania's Urban Areas." *Land Use Policy* 108 (2021): 105572.
- Moussa, I., and P. Li. 2020. "Building Permit Regulatory Burden Index: An Analysis of Building Permit Procedures and Associated Costs in US Municipalities." *Journal of Building Engineering* 29: 101157.
- NAHB (National Association of Home Builders). 2021. "Housing Affordability Is a Critical Issue." https://www.nahb.org/Advocacy/Housing-Affordability.
- NIST (National Institute of Standards and Technology). 2007. "Economic Impact of Property Rights: A Review of the Evidence." https://www.nist.gov/system/files/documents/itl/2007_economic_impact_property_rights.pdf.
- OECD (Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development). 2019. "Building Permit Transparency: Monitoring and Improving Permitting Systems." OECD.
- Ramanathan, R., M. Petersen, L. Srivastava, and K. Fahey. 2018. "Integrating Local Ecological Knowledge and Scientific Data to Inform Environmental Impact Assessments in Coastal Communities: Lessons from India." *Environmental Impact Assessment Review* 73: 173–80.
- Rosenberg, M., J. Amann, H. Blum, and R. Sedano. 2014. "The Potential Impact of Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy Policies on Electricity Markets and CO₂ Emissions of the US Building Sector." *Energy Policy* 73: 180–91.
- Ryan, C., and B. O'Regan. 2015. "Construction and the Environment: A Literature Review." *Journal of Cleaner Production* 109: 48–56.

- Sarris, A., D. Tzovaras, and C. Doukas. 2020. "Digital Transformation of the Building Permit Process: The Case of Greece." *Buildings* 10 (3): 52.
- Tan, R. M. K. 2004. "Restrictions on the Foreign Ownership of Property: Indonesia and Singapore Compared." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 22 (1): 101–11.
- Triana, E. Sanchez, L. Ortolano, G. Ruta, G. Dezfuli, and R. Kanakia. 2011. "Implementation of Environmental Policies." World Bank, Washington, DC.
- UNECE (United Nations Economic Commission for Europe). 2018a. "Transparency in Land Administration." UNECE.
- UNECE (United Nations Economic Commission for Europe). 2018b. "Real Estate Markets and Sustainable Development Goals: Challenges and Opportunities." UNECE.
- Urban Land Institute. 2015. "Myth and Fact: Higher-Density Development and the Future of Metropolitan Areas." https://uli.org/wp-content/uploads/ULI-Documents/HigherDensity_MythFact.ashx_.pdf.
- Van der Molen, P. 2007. "Some Measures to Improve Transparency in Land Administration." TS IA-Land Administration Concepts. http://www-.fig.net/resources/proceedings/fig proceedings/fig2007/papers/ts 1a/ts01a 05 molen 1304.pdf.
- Wang, X., and W. Cen. 2016. "The Impact of Building Permit Approval Speed on Local Economy." *Journal of Real Estate Research* 38 (3): 365–88.
- Wang, Y., and L. Liu. 2015. "Environmental Impact Assessment and Construction Project Delays: Empirical Evidence from China." *Journal of Cleaner Production* 102: 362–69.
- Wehrmann, B. 2008. *Land Conflicts: A Practical Guide to Dealing with Land Disputes*. Eschborn, Germany: Deutche GTZ (Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit).
- Williamson, I. P. 2001. "Land Administration 'Best Practice' Providing the Infrastructure for Land Policy Implementation." *Land Use Policy* 18 (4): 297–307. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0264-8377(01)00021-7.
- World Bank. 2007. Environmental Assessment Sourcebook: Volume 1–Policies, Procedures, and Cross-Cutting Issues. http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTENVIRODEVEL/Resources/EAS_Vol1_all.pdf.
- World Bank. 2014. Gender and Land Tenure in Sub-Saharan Africa. Washington DC: World Bank.
- World Bank Group. No date (n.d.). Zoning and Land Use Planning. https://urban-regeneration.worldbank.org/node/39#:~:text=Why%20is%20zoning%20necessary%3F,down%20 development%20in%20specific%20areas.
- Zakout, W., B. Wehrmann, and M-P Törhönen. 2006. "Good Governance in Land Administration Principles and Good Practices." Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), Rome.

```
<sup>1</sup> Carlson (2000).
<sup>2</sup> Adenuga, Jack, and McCarry (2021).
<sup>3</sup> De Soto (2000); Johnson, McMillan, and Woodruff (2002).
<sup>4</sup> Field (2007); Green and Moser (2013).
<sup>5</sup> Deininger and Feder (2009).
<sup>6</sup> Bennison (2006).
<sup>7</sup> Gathii (2013).
<sup>8</sup> Deininger and Feder (1996).
<sup>9</sup> Wehrmann (2008).
<sup>10</sup> Deininger and Selod (2012).
<sup>11</sup> Deininger and Feder (2009); Zakout, Wehrmann, and Törhönen (2006).
<sup>12</sup> IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013).
<sup>13</sup> Rosenberg et al. (2014).
<sup>14</sup> Garrido, Tapia, and Vergara. 2019.
<sup>15</sup> Babatunde, Yusuf, and Ogunbode (2016).
<sup>16</sup> Boonyabancha, Singhadej, and Dhanapal (2017).
<sup>17</sup> World Bank Group (n.d.).
<sup>18</sup> Dasgupta and Singh (2006).
<sup>19</sup> Hodge and Greve (2017).
<sup>20</sup> Halpern and Lutz (2014).
<sup>21</sup> Tan (2004).
<sup>22</sup> Liao and Zhang (2016).
<sup>23</sup> Golub (2003).
<sup>24</sup> Lee, Lee, and Lee (2014).
<sup>25</sup> Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016).
<sup>26</sup> Gupta and Bansal (2014).
<sup>27</sup> Ryan and O'Regan (2015).
<sup>28</sup> Ramanathan et al. (2018); Sánchez-Triana et al. (2014); Wang and Liu (2015).
<sup>29</sup> Gao et al. (2020).
<sup>30</sup> Gupta, Dunning, and McAllister (2020).
<sup>31</sup> Williamson (2001).
<sup>32</sup> Deininger and Feder (2009).
<sup>33</sup> Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020).
<sup>34</sup> Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018).
<sup>35</sup> Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018).
<sup>36</sup> NIST (2007).
<sup>37</sup> ILC (2017).
<sup>38</sup> Sarris, Tzovaras, and Doukas (2020).
<sup>39</sup> Van der Molen (2007).
<sup>40</sup> World Bank (2024).
<sup>41</sup> FAO (2013).
<sup>42</sup> OECD (2019).
<sup>43</sup> Deininger, K., & Jin, S. (2003).
<sup>44</sup> Amadi-Echendu, Anthea, and Pellissier (2014).
<sup>45</sup> IBA (2019); UNECE (2018b).
<sup>46</sup> Moussa and Li (2020).
<sup>47</sup> Moussa and Li (2020); Wang and Cen (2016).
<sup>48</sup> Ghosh (2013).
<sup>49</sup> Ghosh (2013).
<sup>50</sup> Investopedia, "Transfer Tax." https://www.investopedia.com/terms/t/transfertax.asp).
51 International Code Council, Building Valuation Data. https://www.iccsafe.org/products-and-services/ibc-related-
products/building-valuation-data/).
<sup>52</sup> Several resources mention that the average office space per person lies between 150-250 square feet per person. See for example
Aquila Commercial
                             Guidelines: https://aquilacommercial.com/learning-center/how-much-office-space-need-calculator-per-
person/. For other
                             areas in an office, besides the office space, see Guidance Brokers size
https://www.guidancebrokers.com/resources/calculators/office-space/.
<sup>53</sup> World Bank (2007).
<sup>54</sup> Anhuforom and Awoyemi (2016).
```

55 Mitincu et al. (2021).56 Urban Land Institute (2015).

ANNEX A. BUSINESS LOCATION-SCORING SHEET

This document outlines the scoring approach for the Business Location topic. For every indicator, a Firm Flexibility Point (FFP) and/or a Social Benefits Point (SBP) are assigned, along with a clarification on the detailed scoring for each such indicator and a note on the relevant background literature.

PILLAR I-QUALITY OF REGULATIONS FOR BUSINESS LOCATION						
1.1. PROPERTY TRANSFER AND LAND ADMINISTRATION						
1.1.1 Property Transfer Standards						
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points	Rescaled Points	Background Literature	
Legal Obligation to Check Compliance of Documents with the Law	1	1	2	3.75	Bennison (2006); Deininger and Feder (2009)	
Legal Obligation to Verify Identities of the Parties	1	1	2	3.75	Bennison (2006); Deininger and Feder (2009)	
Legal Obligation to Register Sales Transactions	1	1	2	3.75	Bennison (2006); Deininger and Feder (2009)	
Legal Provision on the Legality of Online Documents	1	1	2	3.75	Bennison (2006); Deininger and Feder (2009)	
Total Points for Subcategory 1.1.1	4	4	8	15.00		
1.1.2 Land Dispute Mechanisms						
Legal Provisions for Arbitration as an Alternative Land Disputes Resolution Mechanism	1	1	2	2.50	Deininger and Feder (1996); Gathii (2013); Wehrmann (2008)	
Legal Provisions for Conciliation or Mediation as Alternative Land Disputes Resolution Mechanisms	1	1	2	2.50	Deininger and Feder (1996); Gathii (2013); Wehrmann (2008)	
Legal Provision for Protection of Property Title	1	1	2	2.50	Deininger and Feder (1996); Gathii (2013); Wehrmann (2008)	
Legal Provisions to Provide Out-of-Court Compensation for Losses due to Erroneous Information from the Immovable Property Registry	1	1	2	2.50	Deininger and Feder (1996); Gathii (2013); Wehrmann (2008)	
Total Points for Subcategory 1.1.2	4	4	8	10.00		
1.1.3 Land Administration System						
Disclosure of Immovable Property Registry Information	1	1	2	3.75	Deininger and Fedor (2009); Deininger and Selod (2012); Zakout, Wehrmann, and Törhönen (2006)	
Infrastructure for Land Administration	1	1	2	3.75	Deininger and Fedor (2009); Deininger and Selod (2012); Zakout, Wehrmann, and Törhönen (2006)	

Disclosure of Cadastral Information	1	1	2	3.75	Deininger and Fedor (2009); Deininger and Selod (2012); Zakout, Wehrmann, and Törhönen (2006)			
Integration of Land Administration and Tax Value Information	1	1	2	3.75	Deininger and Fedor (2009); Deininger and Selod (2012); Zakout, Wehrmann, and Törhönen (2006)			
Total Points for Subcategory 1.1.3	4	4	8	15.00				
Total Points for Category 1.1	12	12	24	40.00				
1.2 BUILDING, ZONING AND LAND USE								
1.2.1 Building Standards								
Building Codes/Standards Applicable to All Constructions	1	1	2	1.36	IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013)			
Clear Provisions or Guidelines Regarding Safety Standards	n/a	1	1	0.68	IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013)			
Regulation of Health Risk Related to Construction Materials	n/a	1	1	0.68	IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013)			
Responsibility for Compliance with Legal Requirements	1	1	2	1.36	IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013)			
Qualifications to Conduct Technical Supervision/Inspections	1	1	2	1.36	IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013)			
Type of Inspections Carried Out During Construction	1	1	2	1.36	IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013)			
Responsibility for Conducting Inspections During Construction	1	1	2	1.36	IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013)			
Requirement of Final Inspection by Law	1	1	2	1.36	IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013)			
Liability for Structural Flaws/Problems	1	1	2	1.36	IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013)			
Occupancy Permit	1	1	2	1.36	Kuprenas and Chalmers (1999);			
Ability to Dispute Building Permit Decisions	1	1	2	1.36	IFC, World Bank, and MIGA (2013)			
Building Control Agency Authority	1	1	2	1.36	Lovegrove and Cotton (2022)			
Total Points for Subcategory 1.2.1	10	12	22	15.00				
1.2.2 Building Energy Standards								
Mandatory Minimum Energy Efficiency Performance Standards	n/a	1	1	5.00	Garrido, Tapia, and Vergara (2019); Rosenberg et al. (2014)			
Energy Efficiency Performance Standards are Verified as Part of the Building Plans Review Process	n/a	1	1	5.00	Garrido, Tapia, and Vergara (2019); Rosenberg et al. (2014)			
Incentives to Promote Green Building Standards	n/a	1	1	5.00	Garrido, Tapia, and Vergara (2019); Rosenberg et al. (2014)			
Total Points for Subcategory 1.2.2	n/a	3	3	15.00				

Requirements for Essential Infrastructure Service Access (Water,	1	1	2	2.00	Babatunde, Yusuf, and Ogunbode (2016);
Electricity, Sanitation)	1	1	2	2.00	Boonyabancha, Singhadej, and Dhanapal (2017); World Bank Group, Zoning and Land Use Planning
Maps that Identify Areas Allocated to Residential, Commercial, Agricultural, Recreational, Public/Institutional, Mixed Use	1	1	2	2.00	Babatunde, Yusuf, and Ogunbode (2016); Boonyabancha, Singhadej, and Dhanapal (2017); World Bank Group, Zoning and Land Use Planning
Hazard Maps that Identify Areas in which Building is Not Permitted due to Natural Hazards	1	1	2	2.00	Babatunde, Yusuf, and Ogunbode (2016); Boonyabancha, Singhadej, and Dhanapal (2017); World Bank Group, Zoning and Land Use Planning
Hazard Maps that Identify Minimum Separation between Residential and Hazardous Occupancies	1	1	2	2.00	Babatunde, Yusuf, and Ogunbode (2016); Boonyabancha, Singhadej, and Dhanapal (2017); World Bank Group, Zoning and Land Use Planning
Maps that Identify Areas in which Building is not Permitted in Relation to Natural Resources	1	1	2	2.00	Babatunde, Yusuf, and Ogunbode (2016); Boonyabancha, Singhadej, and Dhanapal (2017); World Bank Group, Zoning and Land Use Planning
Total Points for Subcategory 1.2.3	5	5	10	10.00	
Total Points for Category 1.2	15	20	35	40.00	
1.3 RESTRICTIONS ON OWNING AND LEASING PROPERTY					
1.3.1 Domestic Firms-Ownership					
1.3.1 Domestic Firms-Ownership Restriction on Ownership Based on the Area of the Land for Domestic Firms	1	n/a	1	0.625	Dasgupta and Singh (2006)
Restriction on Ownership Based on the Area of the Land for Domestic	1	n/a n/a	1	0.625	Dasgupta and Singh (2006) Dasgupta and Singh (2006)
Restriction on Ownership Based on the Area of the Land for Domestic Firms Restriction on Ownership Based on the Location of Property for	1 1 1		1 1 1		
Restriction on Ownership Based on the Area of the Land for Domestic Firms Restriction on Ownership Based on the Location of Property for Domestic Firms	1 1 1	n/a	1 1 1 1	0.625	Dasgupta and Singh (2006)

1.3.2 Domestic Firms-Leasehold					
Restriction on Leasehold Based on the Area of the Land for Domestic Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Halpern and Lutz (2014); Hodge and Greve (2017)
Restriction on the Duration of the Lease for Domestic Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Halpern and Lutz (2014); Hodge and Greve (2017)
Restriction on Leasehold Based on the Location of Property for Domestic Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Halpern and Lutz (2014); Hodge and Greve (2017)
Restriction on Leasehold of Agricultural Property for Domestic Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Halpern and Lutz (2014); Hodge and Greve (2017)
Restrictions on Leasehold Based on the Type of Building for Domestic Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Halpern and Lutz (2014); Hodge and Greve (2017)
Total Points for Subcategory 1.3.2	5	n/a	5	2.50	
1.3.3 Foreign Firms-Ownership					
Restriction on Ownership Based on the Area of the Land for Foreign Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Liao and Zhang (2016); Tan (2004)
Restriction on the Duration of Ownership for Foreign Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Liao and Zhang (2016); Tan (2004)
Restriction on Ownership Based on the Location of Property for Foreign Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Liao and Zhang (2016); Tan (2004)
Restriction on Ownership of Agricultural Land for Foreign Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Liao and Zhang (2016); Tan (2004)
Restriction on Ownership Based on the Type of Building for Foreign Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Liao and Zhang (2016); Tan (2004)
Total Points for Subcategory 1.3.3	5	n/a	5	2.50	
1.3.4 Foreign Firms-Leasehold					
Restriction on Leasehold Based on the Area of the Land for Foreign Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Golub (2003); Lee, Lee, and Lee (2014)
Restriction on the Duration of Lease for Foreign Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Golub (2003); Lee, Lee, and Lee (2014)
Restriction on Leasehold Based on the Location of Property for Foreign Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Golub (2003); Lee, Lee, and Lee (2014)
Restriction on Leasehold of Agricultural Land for Foreign Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Golub (2003); Lee, Lee, and Lee (2014)
Restrictions on Leasehold Based on the Type of Building for Foreign Firms	1	n/a	1	0.50	Golub (2003); Lee, Lee, and Lee (2014)
Total Points for Subcategory 1.3.4	5	n/a	5	2.50	
Total Points for Category 1.3	19	n/a	19	10.00	

1.4 ENVIRONMENTAL PERMITS					
1.4.1 Environmental Permits for Construction					
Environmental Risks as Defined by Legal Framework	n/a	1	1	0.38	Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015)
Environmental Permits Requirements for Construction	n/a	1	1	0.38	Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015)
Enforcement Mechanism for Environmental Permits	n/a	1	1	0.38	Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015)
Qualified Professional/Professional Agency to Conduct EIA	n/a	1	1	0.38	Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015)
Criteria that Trigger an EIA	n/a	1	1	0.38	Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015)
EIA for Projects with Low Environmental Impacts	n/a	1	1	0.38	Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015)
Requirements for an EIA Process	n/a	1	1	0.38	Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015)
Legal Responsibility for Checking Compliance	n/a	1	1	0.38	Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015)
Qualified Professional to Review EIA	n/a	1	1	0.38	Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015)
Enforcement Mechanism of EIA Decisions	n/a	1	1	0.38	Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015)
Liability for Environmental Damages	n/a	1	1	0.38	Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015)
Public Consultations Requirement Elements	n/a	1	1	0.38	Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015)
Disclosure of EIA Information	n/a	1	1	0.38	Grunwald, Bendt, and Kopfmüller (2016); Gupta and Bansal (2014); Ryan and O'Regan (2015)
Total Points for Subcategory 1.4.1	n/a	13	13	5.00	
1.4.2 Dispute Mechanisms for Construction-Related Environ	mental Permits				
Ability to Dispute Environmental Clearances and Permits	1	1	2	2.50	Ramanathan et al. (2018); Sánchez-Triana et al. (2014); Wang and Liu (2015); World Bank (2014)
Out-of-Court Resolution Mechanisms for Environmental Disputes	1	1	2	2.50	Ramanathan et al. (2018); Sánchez-Triana et al. (2014); Wang and Liu (2015); World Bank (2014)
Total Points for Subcategory 1.4.2	2	2	4	5.00	
Total Points for Category 1.4	2	15	17	10.00	
Total Points for Pillar I	48	47	95	100.00	

Note: n/a= not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent). FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point

PILLAR II-QUALITY OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION FOR BUSINESS LOCATION 2.1 AVAILABILITY AND RELIABILITY OF DIGITAL SERVICES

2.1.1 Property Transfer-Digital Public Services

ndicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points	Rescaled Points	Background Literature
Online Due Diligence Checking	1	1	2	1.71	Williamson (2001)
Online Due Diligence Checking – Encumbrances	1	1	2	1.71	Gao et al. (2020); Green and Moser (2013); Gupta, Dunning, and McAllister (2020)
Single Online Platform for Due Diligence Checking	1	1	2	1.71	Williamson (2001)
Online Platform for Property Transfer	1	1	2	1.71	Williamson (2001)
Processes Available Online for Property Transfer	1	1	2	1.71	Williamson (2001)
Complaint Mechanisms for Immovable Property Registry	1	1	2	1.71	Williamson (2001)
Complaint Mechanisms for Cadaster	1	1	2	1.71	Williamson (2001)
Total Points for Subcategory 2.1.1	7	7	14	12.00	
2.1.2 Property Transfer-Digital Land Management and Iden Format of Property Title Certificates	1	1	2	1.50	Gao et al. (2020); Green and Moser (2013);
Format of Cadastral Plans	1	1	2	1.50	Gupta, Dunning, and McAllister (2020) Gao et al. (2020); Green and Moser (2013);
Method to Conduct Cadastral Surveying	1	1	2	1.50	Gupta, Dunning, and McAllister (2020) Gao et al. (2020); Green and Moser (2013); Gupta, Dunning, and McAllister (2020)
National Database for Checking Identification	1	1	2	1.50	Gao et al. (2020); Green and Moser (2013); Gupta, Dunning, and McAllister (2020)
Total Points for Subcategory 2.1.2	4	4	8	6.00	
2.1.3 Property Transfer-Coverage of the Land Registry and	Mapping Agency	•			
Land Registration Coverage at National Level	1	1	2	1.50	Deininger and Feder (2009)
Land Registration Coverage at Main City Level	1	1	2	1.50	Deininger and Feder (2009)
Cadastral Coverage at National Level	1	1	2	1.50	Deininger and Feder (2009)
adastral Coverage at National Level	1		_		
Cadastral Coverage at Main City Level	1	1	2	1.50	Deininger and Feder (2009)

Online Platform for Issuing Building Authorizations	1	1	2	2.00	Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018); Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020)
Online Permitting Systems with Several Functionalities	1	1	2	2.00	Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018); Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020)
Online Permitting Systems to Submit Building and Occupancy Permits	1	1	2	2.00	Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018); Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020)
File Dispute Online on Building Permits	1	1	2	2.00	Ramanathan et al. (2018); Sánchez-Triana et al. (2014); Wang and Liu (2015); World Bank (2014)
Total Points for Subcategory 2.1.4	4	4	8	8.00	
2.1.5 Environmental Permits-Digital Public Services					
Online Permitting Systems to Facilitate Public Participation	1	1	2	2.00	Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018); Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020)
Online Permitting Systems with Several Functionalities	1	1	2	2.00	Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018); Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020)
Paper Copies Required in Conjunction with Online Submission	1	1	2	2.00	Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018); Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020)
File Dispute Online on Environmental Licensing	1	1	2	2.00	Charalambous, Cimren, and Bano (2018); Linnenberg, Gür, and Gür (2020)
Total Points for Subcategory 2.1.5	4	4	8	8.00	
Total Point for Category 2.1	23	23	46	40.00	
2.2 INTEROPERABILITY OF SERVICES					
2.2.1 Interoperability of Services for Property Transfer					
Interoperability between Immovable Property Registry and Cadaster	1	1	2	2.50	ILC (2017); NIST (2007)
Interoperability between Immovable Property Registry and other Services	1	1	2	2.50	ILC (2017); NIST (2007)
Existence of a Geographic Information System (GIS)	1	1	2	2.50	ILC (2017); NIST (2007)
Existence of a Unique Identifier between Immovable Property Registry and Cadaster	1	1	2	2.50	ILC (2017); NIST (2007)
Total Points for Subcategory 2.2.1	4	4	8	10.00	
2.2.2 Interoperability of Services for Building Permits					
Availability of Spatial Plans and Zoning Requirements to All Stakeholders	1	1	2	5.00	Sarris, Tzovaras, and Doukas (2020)
Integration of GIS or National Spatial Platforms	1	1	2	5.00	Sarris, Tzovaras, and Doukas (2020)
Total Points for Subcategory 2.2.2	2	2	4	10.00	

Total Points for Category 2.2	6	6	12	20.00	
2.3 TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION					
2.3.1 Immovable Property (includes gender)					
Publication of Property Transactions Requirements	1	1	2	1.67	Van der Molen (2007)
Transparency of Property Transactions Costs	1	1	2	1.67	Van der Molen (2007)
Service Standards at the Immovable Property Registry	1	1	2	1.67	Van der Molen (2007)
Transparency of Cadaster Costs	1	1	2	1.67	Van der Molen (2007)
Service Standards for Cadaster	1	1	2	1.67	Van der Molen (2007)
Availability of Statistics on Land Transactions	1	1	2	1.67	Van der Molen (2007)
Availability of Statistics on Number and Type of Land Disputes	1	1	2	1.67	Van der Molen (2007)
Availability of Sex-Disaggregated Statistics on Number and Type of Land Disputes	1	1	2	1.67	FAO (2013)
Availability of Statistics on the Average Time to Resolve Land Disputes	1	1	2	1.67	Van der Molen (2007)
Availability of Sex-Disaggregated Data on Land Ownership	1	1	2	1.67	FAO (2013)
Availability of Sex-Disaggregated Data on Land Ownership by Ownership Type	1	1	2	1.67	FAO (2013)
Availability of Information on Property Tax Value	1	1	2	1.67	Van der Molen (2007)
Total Points for Subcategory 2.3.1	12	12	24	20.00	
2.3.2 Building, Zoning and Land Use					
Public Accessibility of Planning and Building Control Regulations	1	1	2	1.875	OECD (2019)
Public Online Availability of Requirements to Obtain All Types of Building Related Permits	1	1	2	1.875	OECD (2019)
Public Online Availability of Requirements Needed to Obtain Occupancy Permit	1	1	2	1.875	OECD (2019)
Applicable Fee Schedules for all Types of Construction Publicly Available and Up to Date	1	1	2	1.875	OECD (2019)
Availability of Official, Updated and Publicly Available Online Statistics Tracking the Number of Issued Building Permits	1	1	2	1.875	OECD (2019)
Updated City Master Plan/Zoning Plan	1	1	2	1.875	OECD (2019)
Steps to Modify Zoning/Land Use Plan	1	1	2	1.875	OECD (2019)

Adherence to Zoning Regulations	1	1	2	1.875	OECD (2019)
Total Points for Subcategory 2.3.2	8	8	16	15.00	
2.3.3 Environmental Permits					
Public Online Availability of Environmental Licensing Requirements for Moderate-Risk Construction Project	1	1	2	1.67	Davis and Barlow (2017)
Applicable and Up to Date Fee Schedule for Environmental Clearances	1	1	2	1.67	Davis and Barlow (2017)
Availability of Official, Updated and Publicly Available List of approved EIAs	1	1	2	1.67	Davis and Barlow (2017)
Total Points for Subcategory 2.3.3	3	3	6	5.00	
Total Points for Category 2.3	23	23	46	40.00	
Total Points for Pillar II	52	52	104	100.00	

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; GIS = Geographic Information System; SBP = Social Benefits Point

PILLAR III-OPERATIONAL EFFICIENCY OF ESTABLISHING A BUSINESS LOCATION						
3.1 PROPERTY TRANSFER AND LAND ADMINISTRATION						
3.1.1 Major Constraints on Access to Land	3.1.1 Major Constraints on Access to Land					
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points	Rescaled Points	Background Literature	
Major Constraints on Access to land	100	n/a	100	13.33	Amadi-Enchendu and Pellissier (2014)	
Total Points for Subcategory 3.1.1	100	n/a	100	13.33		
3.1.2 Time to Transfer a Property						
Time to Transfer a Property	100	n/a	100	13.33	Moussa and Li (2020); Wang and Cen (2016)	
Total Points for Subcategory 3.1.2	100	n/a	100	13.33		
3.1.3 Cost to Transfer a Property						
Cost to Transfer a Property	100	n/a	100	13.33	Kuprenas and Chalmers (1999); NAHB (2021)	
Total Points for Subcategory 3.1.3	100	n/a	100	13.33		
Total Points for Category 3.1	100	n/a	100	40.00		
3.2 CONSTRUCTION PERMITS						
3.2.1 Time to Obtain a Construction-Related Permit						
Time to Obtain a Construction Related Permit	100	n/a	100	13.33	IBA (2019); UNECE (2018)	
Total Points for Subcategory 3.2.1	100	n/a	100	13.33		
3.2.2 Time to Obtain a Building Permit						
Time to Obtain a Building Permit	100	n/a	100	13.33	IBA (2019); UNECE (2018)	
Total Points for Subcategory 3.2.2	100	n/a	100	13.33		
3.2.3 Cost to Obtain a Building Permit						
Cost to Obtain a Building Permit	100	n/a	100	13.33	Kuprenas and Chalmers (1999); NAHB (2021)	
Total Points for Subcategory 3.2.3	100	n/a	100	13.33		
Total Point for Category 3.2	100	n/a	100	40.00		

3.3 ENVIRONMENTAL PERMITS					
3.3.1 Time to Obtain an Environmental Permit					
Time to Obtain an Environmental Permit	100	n/a	100	10.00	Ghosh (2013)
Total Points for Subcategory 3.3.1	100	n/a	100	10.00	
3.3.2 Cost to Obtain an Environmental Permit					
Cost to Obtain an Environmental Permit	100	n/a	100	10.00	Ghosh (2013)
Total Points for Subcategory 3.3.2	100	n/a	100	10.00	
Total Points for Category 3.3	100	n/a	100	20.00	
Total Points for Pillar III	100	n/a	100	100.00	

Note: n/a = not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent). FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point

References

- Amadi-Echendu, A. P., and R. Pellissier. 2014. "Eliminating Bottlenecks in the South African Conveyancing Environment." *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences* 5 (5). Doi:10.5901/mjss. 2014.v5n14p97.
- Babatunde, O. T., R. O., Yusuf, and E. B. Ogunbode. 2016. "Planning for Infrastructure Service Access in Nigerian Cities: An Overview of Policy and Practice." *Habitat International* 53: 156–66.
- Bennison, D. J. 2006. "Developing Effective Property Transaction Standards.' *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 24 (3): 216–35.
- Boonyabancha, S., R. Singhadej, and S. Dhanapal. 2017. "A GIS-based Approach to Land Use Planning for Hazardous Facilities: A Case Study of Rayong Province, Thailand." *Habitat International* 62: 61–70.
- Charalambous, E., E. Cimren, and S. Bano. 2018. "Digitalisation of Building Permitting Procedures in EU Cities." European Parliament.
- Dasgupta, P., and A. Singh. 2006. "Ownership Structure, Corporate Governance, and Firm Performance: Evidence from India." *Journal of Corporate Finance* 12 (4): 645–59.
- Davis, R., and T. Barlow. 2017. "Key Elements of Effective Zoning Regulations." *Journal of the American Planning Association* 83 (3): 236–48.
- Deininger, K., and G. Feder. 1996. "Property Registration and Title Systems in Developing Countries." Policy Research Working Paper 1610, World Bank, Washington, DC.
- Deininger, K., and G. Feder. 2009. "Land Registration, Governance, and Development: Evidence and Implications for Policy." World Bank Research Observer 24 (2): 233–66.
- Deininger, K., & Jin, S. (2003). Tenure security and land-related investment: Evidence from Ethiopia. European Economic Review, 47(5), 967-985.
- Deininger, K., and H. Selod. 2012. "Strengthening Land Governance: Lessons Learned and Best Practices from Country Experiences." *World Bank Research Observer* 27 (2): 142–67.
- FAO (Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. 2013. *Women's Land Rights as a Pathway to Poverty Reduction: A Framework and Review of Available Evidence*. Rome: FAO.
- Gao, X., H. Chen, Y. Li, X. Li, and X. Deng. 2020. "Property Risk Identification Based on Machine Learning Algorithm in Due Diligence Process." *International Journal of Computational Intelligence Systems* 13(1): 387–97.
- Garrido, A., D. Tapia, and C. Vergara. 2019. "Compliance with Energy Codes in Buildings: A Review of International Experiences and Insights for Latin America." *Energy and Buildings* 198: 221–32.
- Gathii, J. T. 2013. "Comparative Land Tenure and Property Rights Systems in Africa." *Journal of African Law* 57 (2): 221–40.

- Ghosh, 2. 2013. "Demystifying the Environmental Clearance Process in India. 6 *NUJS Law Review* Rev. 3 (2013): 433–80.
- Golub, S. 2003. "Measures of Restrictions on Inward Foreign Direct Investment for OECD Countries." OECD Economics Department Working Paper No. 357, OECD Publishing, Paris. https://doi.org/10.1787/335043060125.
- Green, A., and C. Moser. 2013. "Do Property Rights Institutions Matter at the Local Level? Evidence from Madagascar." *Journal of Development Studies* 49 (1): 95–109.
- Grunwald, S., P. Bendt, and J. Kopfmüller. 2016. "Environmental Permits as an Instrument for Sustainable Planning and Decision Making in Infrastructure Projects." *Environmental Impact Assessment Review* 60: 85–93.
- Gupta, M., and P. Bansal. 2014. "Environmental Impact Assessment of Construction Projects: A Comparative Analysis of the Legal Frameworks in India and the United States." *Journal of Environmental Management* 134: 57–66.
- Gupta, A., R. Dunning, and P. McAllister. 2020. "Online Conveyancing Portals in the UK: Benefits and Limitations." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 38 (3): 268–82.
- Halpern, P., and J. Lutz. 2014. "Land Leasing and Land Use Dynamics in Developing Country Cities." *Land Use Policy* 36: 330–37.
- Haltom, R. A., and R. Tanimoto. 2017. "Gender and Performance in the US Real Estate Industry." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 35 (2): 154–71.
- Hodge, T. R., and M. Greve. 2017. "Zoning, Land Use Planning, and the Local Economy." *Journal of Planning Literature* 32 (1): 3–14.
- IBA (International Bar Association). 2019. Transparency in Land Ownership: A Guide to Good Practice. IBA.
- IFC (International Finance Corporation), World Bank, and MIGA (Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency). 2013. "Good Practices for Construction Regulation and Enforcement Reform: Guidelines for Reformers." World Bank Group, Washington, DC.
- ILC (International Land Coalition). 2017. "Improving Land Governance through Interoperability." Briefing Paper. ILC. https://www.landcoalition.org/sites/default/files/documents/resources/ILC_Interoperability_Briefing Paper 2017 0.pdf.
- ILO (International Labour Organization). 2018. "Women in Construction: The State of the Evidence on Drivers, Impacts and Solutions." https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---emp_ent/---ifp_seed/documents/publication/wcms_644392.pdf.
- Kuprenas, J. A., and G. E. Chalmers. 1999. "Occupancy Permit Issuance: A Comparative Study." *Journal of Construction Engineering and Management* 125 (4): 283–87.
- Lee, S., J. Lee, and J. Lee. 2014. "The Effects of Ownership and Capital Structure on Performance: Evidence from Korean Firms." *Asia-Pacific Journal of Financial Studies* 43 (2): 177–202.

- Liao, R., and D. Zhang. 2016. "Property Rights, Investment Incentives, and Foreign Direct Investment." *Journal of Comparative Economics* 44 (4): 1088–1104.
- Linnenberg, T., T. Gür, and T. Gür. 2020. "Digitalisation of Building Permits: Perspectives and Approaches from Selected European Countries." *Journal of European Real Estate Research* 13 (3): 247–63.
- Moussa, I., and P. Li. 2020. "Building Permit Regulatory Burden Index: An Analysis of Building Permit Procedures and Associated Costs in US Municipalities." *Journal of Building Engineering* 29: 101157.
- NAHB (National Association of Home Builders). 2021. "Housing Affordability Is a Critical Issue." https://www.nahb.org/Advocacy/Housing-Affordability.
- NIST (National Institute of Standards and Technology). 2007. "Economic Impact of Property Rights: A Review of the Evidence." NIST. https://www.nist.gov/system/files/documents/itl/2007 economic impact property rights.pdf.
- OECD (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development). 2019. "Building Permit Transparency: Monitoring and Improving Permitting Systems." OECD.
- Ramanathan, R., M. Petersen, L. Srivastava, and K. Fahey. 2018. "Integrating Local Ecological Knowledge and Scientific Data to Inform Environmental Impact Assessments in Coastal Communities: Lessons from India." *Environmental Impact Assessment Review* 73: 173–80.
- Rosenberg, M., J. Amann, H. Blum, and R. Sedano. 2014. "The Potential Impact of Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy Policies on Electricity Markets and CO₂ Emissions of the US Building Sector." *Energy Policy* 73: 180–91.
- Ryan, C., and B. O'Regan. 2015. "Construction and the Environment: A Literature Review." *Journal of Cleaner Production* 109: 48–56.
- Sánchez-Triana, E., S. Enriquez, M. Khanna, J. E. Vinuales, and S. Jampani. 2014. *Balancing Development and Environmental Priorities: Lessons from the Experience of Industrialized Countries and Emerging Economies*. Washington, DC: The World Bank.
- Sarris, A., D. Tzovaras, and C. Doukas. 2020. "Digital Transformation of the Building Permit Process: The Case of Greece." *Buildings* 10 (3): 52.
- Tan, R. M. K. 2004. "Restrictions on the Foreign Ownership of Property: Indonesia and Singapore Compared." *Journal of Property Investment & Finance* 22 (1): 101–111. Doi:10.1108/14635780410525162.
- UNECE (United Nations Economic Commission for Europe). 2018. *Real Estate Markets and Sustainable Development Goals: Challenges and Opportunities*. UNECE.
- Van der Molen, P. 2007. "Some Measures to Improve Transparency in Land Administration. TS IA-Land Administration Concepts. http://www.fig.net/resources/proceedings/fig_proceedings/fig2007/-papers/ts_1a/ts01a_05_molen_1304.pdf.
- Wang, X., and W. Cen. 2016. "The Impact of Building Permit Approval Speed on Local Economy." *Journal of Real Estate Research* 38 (3): 365–88.

- Wang, Y., and L. Liu. 2015. "Environmental Impact Assessment and Construction Project Delays: Empirical Evidence from China." *Journal of Cleaner Production* 102: 362–69.
- Wehrmann, B. 2008. *Land Conflicts: A Practical Guide to Dealing with Land Disputes*. Eschborn, Germany: GTZ (Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit).
- Williamson, I. P. 2001. "Land Administration 'Best Practice' Providing the Infrastructure for Land Policy Implementation." *Land Use Policy* 8 (4): 297–307. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0264-8377(01)00021-7
- World Bank. 2014. Gender and Land Tenure in Sub-Saharan Africa. Washington DC: World Bank.
- World Bank Group. No date (n.d.). Zoning and Land Use Planning. https://urban-regeneration.worldbank.org/node/39#:~:text=Why%20is%20zoning%20necessary%3F,down%20 development%20in%20specific%20areas.
- Zakout, W., B. Wehrmann, and M-P Törhönen. 2006. "Good Governance in Land Administration Principles and Good Practices." Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), Rome.

ANNEX B. BUSINESS LOCATION-ANNOTATED QUESTIONNAIRE

Annex B consists of a Glossary and Annotated Questionnaires for Property Transfer, Building Permits and Environmental Permits. The Annotated Questionnaire provides the mapping between each indicator and the corresponding question(s).

Glossary

Accessibility and inclusivity requirements: Refers to provisions to ensure that buildings are accessible to all individuals, including those with disabilities, through features such as ramps, elevators, accessible restrooms, and signage.

Active fire safety measures: Refers to systems that require some amount of action or motion in order to work effectively in the event of a fire (for e.g.- fire extinguisher or sprinkler system). Passive fire safety measures refer to systems that compartmentalize a building through the use of fire-resistance-rated walls/floors, doors and gap-filling measures.

Arbitration: An alternative dispute resolution process where the parties submit their legal dispute to one or more independent third parties (arbitrators) who issue a binding decision (award).

Building classification: Is the set criteria for categorizing buildings based on their use, occupancy type, and size.

Building control agency: Is a division, mostly within a local government, that is responsible for the application and enforcement of building codes and regulations. Naming conventions can differ across countries.

Building envelope: Refers to the physical barrier between the conditioned interior of a building and the exterior environment. It includes all the components of a building that enclose its internal spaces, such as the walls, roof, windows, doors, and foundation.

Cadaster: An official public inventory outlining details of the ownership, value, location, and legal boundaries (often represented on maps) of each parcel of land.

Cadastral plan: A map or graphical representation of a particular parcel of land showing its boundaries, dimensions, and other physical features, accurately depicting and documenting the spatial extents of land ownership.

Commercial building: Refers to buildings where commercial activities take place. Commercial buildings include office buildings, retail space, warehouses, and more.

Commercial construction: A property where the land is vacant of all buildings and the owner plans on constructing offices dedicated solely to conducting business (with no residential dwellings on site).

Conciliation: Please refer to the Mediation definition.

Contractual law: Law that involves agreements between people, businesses, and groups and carries legal responsibilities if the agreement is breached.

Dedicated green management teams: Teams in building and planning departments that are dedicated to helping builders plan and build green buildings.

Deed: A legal document that formally transfers ownership of real property from one person or entity to another.

Density bonuses: Are incentives that allow developers to build more than usually permitted if they exceed certain environmental performance or sustainability benchmarks. These incentives encourage the incorporation of green building practices, such as energy efficiency and sustainable materials, into new developments.

Digitization: The conversion of paper-based documents (such as property title certificates and cadastral plans) into digital format and enabling online access, often integrated into digital systems for online updating, management, and retrieval.

Direct surveying: Geodesic and topographic surveying conducted on-site (in situ), utilizing precision instruments for measuring angles and distances.

Discounted development application: A discount on the development application fee provided to builders as an incentive for adopting green building measures.

Due diligence clearance: A comprehensive investigation and verification process conducted to verify the ownership of the property and ensure there are no outstanding taxes, encumbrances, or legal, financial, and physical issues that could impede the transfer. It might include (but is not limited to): encumbrance checking, title search (to confirm ownership) checking, obtaining authorization to transfer state-owned land, outstanding taxes (property or other taxes) checking, bankruptcy checking, utilities (outstanding bills) checking, company profile checking, cadastral plan checking, zoning plan checking, building certificate from municipal council checking, informing the local council of sale and selling price, obtaining drainage certificate from water authority, identification surveying from licensed surveyor.

Energy efficiency in building design and sustainability: refers to the incorporation of design strategies, materials, and technologies that minimize the energy consumption of a building while maintaining comfort and functionality. This can include insulation, energy-efficient windows and doors, energy-efficient HVAC systems, and the use of renewable energy sources like solar panels.

Environmental scoping: A more detailed process than environmental screening that aims to identify the key environmental issues and potential impacts that need to be addressed in a comprehensive environmental impact assessment.

Environmental screening: The activity of deciding which matters will be investigated as part of the environmental assessment (EIA), once a decision has been made that an EIA is required (that is, once a screening decision has been made).

Expedited permitting: Process that allows a municipality to offer significant incentives for green buildings at little or no cost because this strategy only requires a shift in permitting priority.

Fire safety standards: Refer to a set of precautions and systems put in place to reduce the risk of fires and ensure the safety of occupants in a building. These measures are typically required by building codes and regulations and may include both passive and active fire safety systems.

Floor-to-area density (FAR) bonus: A zoning incentive offered by local governments to encourage developers to build more densely on a given parcel of land than the zoning code would otherwise allow.

Full environmental impact assessment: Evaluation of the effects of public and private projects on the environment. The assessment will be proportionate to the potential risks and impacts of the project, and will assess, in an integrated way, all relevant direct, indirect, and cumulative environmental and social risks and impacts throughout the project life cycle. Key stages in the environmental assessment process include screening, alternatives, preliminary assessment, scoping, mitigation, main EIA study and environmental impact statement, review, and monitoring.

Geographic information system (GIS): A computer-based system designed to capture, store, analyze, manipulate, and present spatial and geographic data. It is a fully digital geographic representation of the plot of land, showing both the spatial information and the different attributes.

Green building standards: Are a model code that contains minimum requirements for increasing the environmental and health performance of buildings, sites, and structures.

Guarantee: This means that either the government or another authorized agency provides a legal guarantee that the person listed on the title has clear and undisputed ownership rights to that property.

Guarantee program incentive for green buildings: Is a set of incentives that provides financial support to building owners, developers, or lenders to encourage the construction or renovation of buildings that meet certain environmental standards. The Guarantee program provides a guarantee or an insurance policy that the building will perform as intended and meet specified environmental standards. The guarantee may cover the cost of energy savings or other environmental benefits that the building will provide over a certain period of time, typically several years.

Health and sanitation requirements: Refer to the standards ensuring buildings provide a safe, hygienic, and healthy environment for occupants by establishing requirements such as water supply, waste disposal, ventilation, plumbing, or other parameters.

Housing development project: One or more buildings that collectively contain ten or more new or additional housing units on one or more parcels or lots under common ownership or control, including contiguous parcels.

Immovable property registry: An official public inventory that documents and maintains information on ownership of all types of immovable property, including land and buildings.

Indirect surveying: Photogrammetric surveying conducted using high-resolution aerial photographs, with the use of instruments such as airplanes or drones.

Inspections: Are the official examination and review of the various stages of building work by a designated authority to ensure that the construction complies with the approved plans, building codes, and other regulations.

Land registry: An official public inventory that documents and maintains information on land ownership through recording titles (rights on land) or deeds (documents concerning changes in the legal situation of land).

Land use regulations: These are zoning regulations to govern land use, density, setbacks, and other development parameters.

List of requirements: Includes all the documents and steps necessary to obtain a building permit.

Maintenance and renovation requirements: These are guidance on building maintenance requirements, periodic inspections, and renovation procedures to ensure the ongoing safety and functionality of existing structures.

Mediation: An alternative dispute resolution process, irrespective of the expression used (for example, the term sometimes might be referred to as Conciliation) or the basis upon which the process is carried out, whereby parties request an independent third person or persons (such as the mediator) to assist them in their attempt to reach an amicable settlement of a legal dispute. In contrast to court litigation or arbitration, the mediator does not have the authority to impose a solution on the parties to the dispute.

Mixed surveying: A combination of direct (on-site) and indirect (photogrammetric) surveying for each parcel of land.

National building code: Is a set of standards established at a national level and enforced by local government for the structural safety of buildings.

Net metering: An electricity billing mechanism that allows consumers who generate some or all of their own electricity to use that electricity anytime, instead of when it is generated.

Occupancy permit: Also known as a certificate of occupancy, is an official document issued by a local government agency or building department certifying that a building is in a condition suitable for use and occupancy.

Online communication: This is a communication feature such as messaging or email notification that can be crucial for efficient interaction between users and authorities regarding permit applications.

Online notification: Refers to notifications about application status updates or deadlines that can significantly enhance user experience and transparency in the permit process.

Out-of-court compensation mechanism: A compensation scheme established by law to compensate people who suffer loss or damage, through no fault of their own, because of an error at the land registry.

Passive fire safety measures: Systems that compartmentalize a building through the use of fire-resistance-rated walls/floors, doors, and gap-filling measures.

Phased inspections: Inspections that are carried out at specific stages during construction.

Planning approvals: Is the consent granted by the local government, building, or planning authority for the construction or alteration of a building or structure. This approval is necessary before construction or renovation can commence and ensures that the proposed development is in accordance with local planning regulations, zoning laws, and development guidelines. The process of obtaining planning approval often involves submitting detailed plans and supporting documents for review, and may also require public consultation or notification of neighbors.

Pre-approvals: Are typically sought before a full building permit application is submitted, to ensure that the project is viable and to identify any potential issues that could prevent the project from moving forward. Examples of such pre-approvals are electrical, water, sewerage, environmental approvals, before a building permit application can be submitted and processed.

Property title certificate: A document usually issued by the land registry that officially confirms the title, proving the right of ownership of a property. It includes details such as the owner's name and property description, making the ownership enforceable against third parties.

Private title insurance: Private title insurance guarantees indemnity to the new owner of a property if there is a defect in the title or encumbrances are discovered in the property later on.

Public consultation: Effective community engagement through disclosure of project-related information, consultation, and effective feedback in particular with affected communities, and in providing project-based grievance mechanisms. Such information will be disclosed in a timely manner, in an accessible place, and in a form and language understandable to project-affected parties and other interested parties.

Qualification exam: This is any examination that one needs to pass in order to being able to practice legally as an engineer or architect.

Quality assurance inspections and compliance enforcement: These are procedures for obtaining building permits, conducting inspections, and enforcing compliance with building regulations to ensure that constructed buildings meet safety, health, and environmental standards.

Quality control: In construction, evaluates the strength of quality control and safety mechanisms during the construction process, the liability and insurance regimes, and professional certification requirements to conduct the construction.

Random/unscheduled technical inspection: Are inspections that can occur at any time or at any stage (during construction).

Registration of deeds: A system whereby a register of documents is maintained relating to the transfer of rights in land.

Registration of title: A system whereby a register of ownership of land is maintained based on the parcel rather than the owner or the deeds transfer.

Regulatory relief: Is a non-financial incentive for green buildings, which involves simplified regulatory processing or reduced regulatory processing for builders if green building elements are adopted in the construction.

Restrictions on the location of property: Regulatory limitations imposed on where a property can be situated or developed. For the purposes of this questionnaire, these restrictions do not include restrictions related to (i) Protected and conserved areas due to their natural or ecological value (e.g., national parks), (ii) Special cultural inheritance areas (e.g., old city centers with special historical status), (iii) Areas significant for national defense (e.g., proximity to military bases), (iv) agricultural land.

Risk-based type inspections: Is a method for inspecting buildings that prioritizes the assessment of structures based on the level of risk they present. Instead of inspecting all buildings with the same level of scrutiny, a risk-based approach targets resources and attention to buildings that pose a higher risk, such as those with structural issues, older buildings, or those used for specific high-risk activities.

Simplified environmental impact assessment: Environmental permit involving environmental study with limited scope.

State guarantee: The title is guaranteed by the State and in the event of a defect in the title, it is the State that will compensate for the loss.

Strategic environmental assessment: A systematic examination of environmental and social risks and impacts, and issues associated with a policy, plan, or program, typically at the national level but also in smaller areas. The examination of environmental and social risks and impacts will include consideration of the full range of environmental and social risks and impacts.

Structural requirements: These are specifications for structural design, materials, and construction techniques to ensure buildings' stability and resistance to various loads, including gravity, wind, seismic activity, and other environmental factors. They constitute guidelines for designing buildings to withstand natural hazards such as earthquakes, floods, hurricanes, and tsunamis, including structural reinforcement, site selection criteria, and evacuation planning.

Title: A legal right of ownership of real property.

Title search certificate: A document that summarizes the history of ownership of a property, i.e. title search. It confirms the current owner identifies any existing liens, mortgages, or other claims on the property, and ensures there are no issues that could affect the transfer of ownership.

Unique identifier: A unique identification number used by both the land registry and the cadaster/mapping agency to identify the same property in their databases.

Zoning plan: The plan of area maintained in the office of the competent authority showing the permitted use of land and such other restrictions on the development of land as may be prescribed in the zoning regulations.

PROPERTY TRANSFER QUESTIONNAIRE

The tables that follow present all indicators (including their components, if applicable) under each pillar, with a reference to the corresponding question number in parenthesis. The questions are listed before each table for ease of reference.

For Y/N questions, the Y response accounts for the score and is considered as the good practice, unless otherwise indicated with the sign "Y/N; N - good practice".

In the tables that follow, "AND" means all referenced questions must have a good practice response to obtain a score on the indicator.

In the tables that follow, "OR" means one or more referenced questions must have a good practice response to obtain a score on the indicator.

Certain questions are marked as "not scored," which indicates that they do not affect the score in any way. The purpose of these questions is to further inform and refine the questions design for subsequent years of the rollout phase, as needed, as well as to substantiate and provide further information for the scored questions.

PILLAR I-QUALITY OF REGULATIONS FOR BUSINESS LOCATION				
Parameters				
Business Location	The largest (most populous) city in the economy. The parameter is used in cases where regulations may not be applicable at a national level and vary across states or regions. Geographical location determines selection of appropriate property registry in charge of property transfer. For Pilar I, if regulations differ across states within an economy, the experts will be asked to provide information regarding regulations of the largest city.			

1.1 PROPERTY TRANSFER AND LAND ADMINISTRATION

1.1.1 Property Transfer Standards

- 1. Is there a legal obligation to verify that all documents required for a property transaction comply with the applicable laws and regulations? (Y/N)
- 2. According to the regulatory framework, is it required to verify the identity of each party involved in a property transaction? (Y/N)
- 3. According to the regulatory framework, must all property sale transactions be registered with the immovable property registry (through registration of deeds and/or registration of titles) to be enforceable against third parties? (Y/N)
- 4. According to the regulatory framework, does a <u>property title certificate</u> issued online hold the same legal validity as a paper-based property title certificate? (Y/N)
- 5. According to the regulatory framework, does a <u>title search certificate</u> issued online hold the same legal validity as a paper-based title search certificate? (Y/N)

- 6. According to the regulatory framework, does a <u>tax certificate</u> issued online hold the same legal validity as a paper-based tax certificate? (Y/N)
- 7. According to the regulatory framework, does a <u>company profile document</u> issued online hold the same legal validity as a paper-based company profile document? (Y/N)
- 8. According to the regulatory framework, do <u>cadastral plans</u> issued online hold the same legal validity as paper-based cadastral plans? (Y/N)

1.1.2 Land Dispute Mechanisms

- 9. According to the regulatory framework, is arbitration offered as an out-of-court resolution mechanism for land disputes between private parties? (Y/N)
- 10. According to the regulatory framework, is conciliation or mediation offered as an out-of-court resolution mechanism for land disputes between private parties? (Y/N)
- 11. According to the regulatory framework, does the government or an authorized entity provide a guarantee (state guarantee or private title insurance) for the property title validity and accuracy, allowing for compensation payments to parties who incur losses due to errors made by the immovable property registry? (Y/N)
- 12. According to the regulatory framework, is there a specific out-of-court compensation mechanism (such as a fund or an insurance) to cover for losses incurred by parties who engaged in good faith in a property transaction based on erroneous information certified by the immovable property registry? (Y/N)

1.1.3 Land Administration System

- 13. According to the regulatory framework, is access to property ownership information granted to anyone (either for a fee or for free)? (Y/N)
- 14. According to the regulatory framework, is there a cadaster/mapping agency in [ECONOMY]? (Y/N)
- 15. According to the regulatory framework, is access to cadastral plans of privately held land plots granted to anyone (either for a fee or for free)? (Y/N)
- 16. According to the regulatory framework, does the cadaster (or immovable property registry, if applicable) include information on tax value of the real property? (Y/N)

1.1 PROPERTY TRANSFER AND LAND ADMINISTRATION				
1.1.1 Property Transfer Standards				
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points	
Legal Obligation to Check Compliance of Documents with the Law (1)	1	1	2	
Legal Obligation to Verify Identities of Parties (2)	1	1	2	
Legal Obligation to Register Sales Transactions (3)	1	1	2	

Legal Provisions on the Legality of Online Documents	1	1	2
- Property title certificate (4)	0.2	0.2	0.4
- Title search certificate (5)	0.2	0.2	0.4
- Tax certificate (6)	0.2	0.2	0.4
- Company profile document (7)	0.2	0.2	0.4
- Cadastral plans (8)	0.2	0.2	0.4
Total Points	4	4	8
1.1.2 Land Dispute Mechanisms			
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Legal Provisions for Arbitration as an Alternative Land Disputes Resolution Mechanism (9)	1	1	2
Legal Provisions for Conciliation or Mediation as Alternative Land Disputes Resolution Mechanisms (10)	1	1	2
Legal Provisions for Protection of Property Title (11)	1	1	2
Legal Provisions to Provide Out-of-Court Compensation for Losses	1	1	2
Due to Erroneous Information from the Immovable Property Registry (12)			
Total Points	4	4	8
1.1.3 Land Administration System			
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Disclosure of Immovable Property Registry Information (13)	1	1	2
Infrastructure for Land Administration (14)	1	1	2
Disclosure of Cadastral Information (15)	1	1	2
Integration of Land Administration and Tax Value Information (16)	1	1	2
Total Points	4	4	8

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

1.3 Restrictions on Owning and Leasing Property

1.3.1 Domestic Firms-Ownership

- 17. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions on the <u>size of the land</u> that domestic firms can own? $(Y/N; N-good\ practice)$
- 18. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions on the <u>location of property</u> that domestic firms can own? (Y/N; N good practice)
- 19. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions for domestic firms on owning agricultural land? (Y/N; N good practice)
- 20. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions on the <u>type of property</u> (<u>residential</u>, <u>commercial</u>, <u>industrial</u>) that domestic firms can own? (Y/N; N good practice)

1.3.2 Domestic Firms-Leasehold

- 21. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions on the <u>size of the land</u> that domestic firms can lease? (Y/N; N good practice)
- 22. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions for domestic firms on the duration of the lease? (Y/N; N good practice)
- 23. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions on the <u>location of property</u> that domestic firms can lease? (Y/N; N good practice)
- 24. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions for domestic firms on leasing <u>agricultural land</u>? (Y/N; N good practice)
- 25. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions on the <u>type of property</u> (residential, commercial, industrial) that domestic firms can lease? (Y/N; N good practice)

1.3.3 Foreign Firms-Ownership

- 26. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions on the <u>size of the land</u> that foreign firms can own? $(Y/N; N-good\ practice)$
- 27. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions for foreign firms on the duration of ownership? (Y/N; N good practice)
- 28. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions on the <u>location of property</u> to own for foreign firms? (Y/N; N good practice)
- 29. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions for foreign firms to own agricultural land? (Y/N; N good practice)
- 30. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions on the <u>type of property</u> (residential, commercial, industrial) that foreign firms can own? (Y/N; N good practice)

1.3.4 Foreign Firms-Leasehold

- 31. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions on the <u>size of the land</u> that foreign firms can lease? (Y/N; N good practice)
- 32. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions for foreign firms on the duration of the lease? (Y/N; N good practice)
- 33. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions on the <u>location of property</u> that foreign firms can lease? (Y/N; N good practice)
- 34. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions for foreign firms on leasing agricultural land? (Y/N; N good practice)
- 35. According to the regulatory framework, are there any restrictions on the <u>type of property</u> (residential, commercial, industrial) that foreign firms can lease? (Y/N; N good practice)

1.3 RESTRICTIONS ON OWNING AND LEASING PROPERTY			
1.3.1 Domestic Firms-Ownership			
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Restriction on Ownership Based on the Area of the Land for Domestic Firms (17)	1	n/a	1
Restriction on Ownership based on the Location of Property for Domestic Firms (18)	1	n/a	1
Restriction on Ownership of Agricultural Land for Domestic Firm (19)	1	n/a	1
Restriction on Ownership based on the Type of Building for Domestic Firms (20)	1	n/a	1
Total Points	4	0	4
1.3.2 Domestic Firms-Leasehold			
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Restriction on Leasehold based on the Area of the Land for Domestic Firms (21)	1	n/a	1
Restriction on the Duration of the Lease for Domestic Firms (22)	1	n/a	1
Restriction on Leasehold based on the Location of Property for Domestic Firms (23)	1	n/a	1
Restriction on Leasehold of Agricultural Property for Domestic Firms (24)	1	n/a	1
Restriction on Leasehold based on the Type of Building for Domestic Firms (25)	1	n/a	1
Total Points	5	0	5
1.3.3 Foreign Firms-Ownership			
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Restriction on Ownership based on the Area of the Land for Foreign Firms (26)	1	n/a	1
Restriction on the Duration of Ownership for Foreign Firms (27)	1	n/a	1
Restriction on Ownership Based on Location of Property for Foreign Firms (28)	1	n/a	1
Restriction on Ownership of Agricultural Land for Foreign Firms (29)	1	n/a	1
Restriction on Ownership based on the Type of Building for Foreign Firms (30)	1	n/a	1
Total Points	5	0	5
1.3.4 Foreign Firms-Leasehold			
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Restriction on Leasehold based on the Area of the Land for Foreign Firms (31)	1	n/a	1
Restriction on the Duration of Lease for Foreign Firms (32)	1	n/a	1

Restriction on Leasehold based on the Location of Property for	1	n/a	1
Foreign Firms (33)			
Restriction on Leasehold of Agricultural Land for Foreign Firms	1	n/a	1
(34)			
Restriction on Leasehold based on the Type of Building for Foreign	1	n/a	1
Firms (35)			
Total Points	5	0	5

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

PILLAR II-QUALITY OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION FOR BUSINESS LOCATION				
Parameters				
Business Location	The largest (most populous) city in the economy. The parameter is used in cases where regulations may not be applicable at a national level and vary across states or regions. The land registry, the tax authorities, and the cadastral services of the largest city will be considered for all questions under Pillar II. For all questions in Pillar II, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se.			

2.1 AVAILABILITY AND RELIABILITY OF DIGITAL SERVICES

2.1.1 Property Transfer–Digital Public Services

- **36.** Is it possible to conduct a <u>title search</u> online when transferring property ownership? (Y/N)
- 37. Is it possible to conduct an online search on <u>outstanding taxes on property</u> when transferring property ownership? (Y/N)
- 38. Is it possible to conduct an online search on <u>bankruptcy</u> when transferring property ownership? (Y/N)
- 39. Is it possible to conduct an online <u>company profile</u> search, transferring property ownership? (Y/N)
- 40. Is it possible to conduct an online <u>cadastral plan</u> search when transferring property ownership? (Y/N)
- 41. Is it possible to conduct an online liens search when transferring property ownership? (Y/N)
- 42. Is it possible to conduct an online search on <u>mortgages</u> when transferring property ownership? (Y/N)
- 43. Is it possible to conduct an online search on <u>easements</u> when transferring property ownership? (Y/N)
- 44. Is it possible to conduct an online search on <u>restrictions</u> when transferring property ownership? (Y/N)
- 45. Can all the necessary due diligence checks for property transfer be done on a <u>single</u> online platform? (Y/N)

- 46. Is there a single online platform that facilitates the entire process of registering property ownership transfer (through registration of deeds and/or registration of titles), including initiation, verification, submission, and issuance of updated records? (Y/N)
 - $Y \rightarrow Provide response to questions 47, 48, 49, and 50.$
- 47. Does this online platform allow users to <u>download necessary documents</u> (for example, the transfer deed, the title deed, registration documents) related to property ownership transfer? (Y/N)
- 48. Does this online platform allow users to <u>upload necessary documents</u> (for example, completed forms, copies of identification documents) related to property ownership transfer? (Y/N)
- 49. Does this online platform facilitate $\frac{\text{receiving notifications}}{\text{to property transfers?}}$ regarding updates, status changes, or important communications related to property transfers? (Y/N)
- 50. Can all <u>necessary payments</u> related to transfer of property ownership be processed via this online platform? (Y/N)
- 51. Is there an online platform where complaints about services and/or suggestions for improvements at immovable property registry can be filed? (Y/N)
 - $Y \rightarrow$ Provide response to question 52.
- 52. Are the responses to complaints from the immovable property registry publicly available on this platform? (Y/N)
- 53. Is there an online platform at the cadaster/mapping agency to file complaints about services and/or suggestions for improvements? (Y/N)
 - $Y \rightarrow Provide response to question 54.$
- 54. Are the responses to complaints from the cadaster/mapping agency publicly available on this platform? (Y/N)
- 2.1.2 Property Transfer–Digital Land Management and Identification System
- 55. What is the format in which the majority of property title certificates (or equivalent documents confirming property ownership) are maintained at the immovable property registry?
 - 55a. Paper format
 - 55b. Digitized (certificates are scanned)
 - 55c. Digitalized (certificates are digital and can be modified online)
- 56. What is the format in which the majority of cadastral plans are kept at the cadaster/mapping agency?
 - 56a. Paper format
 - 56b. Digitized (plans are scanned)
 - 56c. Digitalized (plans are digital and can be modified online)
- 57. What method is used for cadastral surveying?
 - 57a. Direct (in situ surveying)
 - 57b. Mixed (combination of in situ surveying and high-resolution pictures for each land parcel)
 - 57c. Indirect (high resolution pictures)

- 58. Is there an electronic national database available for verifying the accuracy of government-issued identity documents used in property transactions? (Y/N)
- 2.1.3 Property Transfer-Coverage of the Land Registry and Mapping Agency
- 59. Are all privately held land plots formally registered at the land registry in [ECONOMY]? (Y/N) N → provide response to question 60.
- 60. What is your estimate on the percentage of privately held land plots that are formally registered at the land registry in [ECONOMY]?

60a. Above 50 percent

60b. Below 50 percent

- 61. Are all privately held land plots formally registered at the land registry in [CITY]? (Y/N) N → provide response to question 62.
- 62. What is your estimate on the percentage of privately held land plots that are formally registered at the land registry in [CITY]?

62a. Above 50 percent

62b. Below 50 percent

63. Are all privately held land plots formally mapped and surveyed in the cadaster/mapping agency in [ECONOMY]? (Y/N)

 $N \rightarrow$ provide response to question 64.

64. What is your estimate on the percentage of privately held land plots that are formally mapped and surveyed in the cadaster/mapping agency in [ECONOMY]?

64a. Above 50 percent

64b. Below 50 percent

- 65. Are all privately held land plots formally mapped and surveyed in the cadaster in [CITY]? (Y/N) N → provide response to question 66.
- 66. What is your estimate on the percentage of privately held land plots that are formally mapped and surveyed in the cadaster/mapping agency in [CITY]?

66a. Above 50 percent

66b. Below 50 percent

2.1 AVAILABILITY AND RELIABILITY OF DIGITAL SERVICES Property Transfer-Digital Public Services 2.1.1 Total **Indicators** FFP **SBP Points Online Due Diligence Checking** 1 2 - Title search (ownership) (36) 0.2 0.2 0.4 - Outstanding taxes (tax agency) (37) 0.2 0.2 0.4 - Bankruptcy search (38) 0.2 0.2 0.4 0.2 0.2 0.4 - Company profile (39) 0.2 0.2 - Cadastral plan (40) 0.4

Online Due Diligence Checking – Encumbrances	1	1	2
- Liens (41)	0.25	0.25	0.5
- Mortgages (42)	0.25	0.25	0.5
- Easements (43)	0.25	0.25	0.5
- Restrictions (44)	0.25	0.25	0.5
Single Online Platform for Due Diligence Checking (45)	1	1	2
Online Platform for Property Transfer (46)	1	1	2
Processes Available Online for Property Transfer	1	1	2
- Downloading forms (47)	0.25	0.25	0.5
- Uploading documents (48)	0.25	0.25	0.5
- Getting notifications (49)	0.25	0.25	0.5
- Processing payments (50)	0.25	0.25	0.5
Complaint Mechanisms for Immovable Property Registry	1	1	2
- Online platform for complaints (51)	0.5	0.5	1
- Responses to complains made publicly available (52)	0.5	0.5	1
Complaint Mechanisms for Cadaster	1	1	2
- Online platform for complaints (53)	0.5	0.5	1
- Responses to complains made publicly available (54)	0.5	0.5	1
Total Points	7	7	14
2.1.2 Property Transfer–Digital Land Management and	Identification S	ystem	
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total
Former of all Duran outs. Title Contilled to	1	1	Points
Format of Property Title Certificates	1 1 OR	1 1 OR	2 2 OR
- Certificates are digitalized (55c) OR	0.5	0.5	
- Certificates are digitized (55b)			1
Format of Cadastral Plans	1	1 00	2 2 OB
- Plans are digitalized (56c) OR	1 OR	1 OR	2 OR
- Plans are digitized (56b)	0.5	0.5	1
Method to Conduct Cadastral Surveying	1	1	2
- Direct (57a) OR			
- Mixed (57b) National Database for Checking Identification (58)	1	1	2
	1	_	
Total Points	4	4	8
2.1.3 Property Transfer-Coverage of the Land Registry a	and Mapping A	gency	
			Total
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Points
	FFP 1	SBP 1	
Land Registration Coverage at National Level		SBP 1 1 OR	Points 2
Land Registration Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (59) OR	1	1	Points
Land Registration Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (59) OR - Above 50% (60a)	1 1 OR	1 1 OR	Points 2
Land Registration Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (59) OR - Above 50% (60a) Land Registration Coverage at Main Business City Level	1 1 OR	1 1 OR	Points 2 2 OR 1
Land Registration Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (59) OR - Above 50% (60a)	1 1 OR 0.5	1 1 OR 0.5	Points 2 2 OR 1 2
Land Registration Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (59) OR - Above 50% (60a) Land Registration Coverage at Main Business City Level - Full coverage (61) OR - Above 50% (62a)	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR	Points 2 2 OR 1 2 2 OR 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 2 1 2 OR 1
Land Registration Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (59) OR - Above 50% (60a) Land Registration Coverage at Main Business City Level - Full coverage (61) OR - Above 50% (62a) Cadastral Coverage at National Level	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5	Points 2 2 OR 1 2 2 OR 1 2 1 2 2 OR 1
Land Registration Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (59) OR - Above 50% (60a) Land Registration Coverage at Main Business City Level - Full coverage (61) OR - Above 50% (62a) Cadastral Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (63) OR	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR	Points 2 2 OR 1 2 2 OR 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 2 1 2 OR 1
Land Registration Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (59) OR - Above 50% (60a) Land Registration Coverage at Main Business City Level - Full coverage (61) OR - Above 50% (62a) Cadastral Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (63) OR - Above 50% (64a)	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5	Points 2 2 OR 1 2 2 OR 1 2 2 OR 1 2 2 OR 1 1 2 1 2 OR 1
Land Registration Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (59) OR - Above 50% (60a) Land Registration Coverage at Main Business City Level - Full coverage (61) OR - Above 50% (62a) Cadastral Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (63) OR - Above 50% (64a) Cadastral Coverage at Main Business City Level	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5	Points 2 2 OR 1 2 2 OR 2 OR 1
Land Registration Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (59) OR - Above 50% (60a) Land Registration Coverage at Main Business City Level - Full coverage (61) OR - Above 50% (62a) Cadastral Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (63) OR - Above 50% (64a) Cadastral Coverage at Main Business City Level - Full coverage (65) OR	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR	Points 2 2 OR 1 2 2 OR 1 2 2 OR 1 2 2 OR 2 2 OR 2 0 OR 1
Land Registration Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (59) OR - Above 50% (60a) Land Registration Coverage at Main Business City Level - Full coverage (61) OR - Above 50% (62a) Cadastral Coverage at National Level - Full coverage (63) OR - Above 50% (64a) Cadastral Coverage at Main Business City Level	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1	1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5 1 1 OR 0.5	Points 2 2 OR 1 2 2 OR 2 OR 1

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

2.2 INTEROPERABILITY OF SERVICES

2.2.1 Interoperability of Services for Property Transfer

- 67. Is there an integrated database at the immovable property registry that shares updated information on property registration electronically and in real time with the cadaster/mapping agency? (Y/N)
- 68. Is there an integrated database at the immovable property registry that shares updated information electronically and in real time on property registration with agencies, other than the cadaster/mapping agency? (Y/N)

 $N \rightarrow Provide response to question 70.$

- 69. Does the immovable property registry or cadaster/mapping agency use a Geographical Information System (GIS)? (Y/N)
- 70. Do the immovable property registry and cadaster/mapping agency use a common unique identifier to search for properties? (Y/N)

2.2 INTEROPERABILITY OF SERVICES			
2.2.1 Interoperability of Services for Property Transfer			
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Interoperability between Immovable Property Registry and Cadaster (67)	1	1	2
Interoperability between Immovable Property Registry and other Services (68)	1	1	2
Existence of a Geographic Information System (GIS) (69)	1	1	2
Existence of a Unique Identifier between Land Registry and Cadaster (70)	1	1	2
Total Points	4	4	8

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

2.3 TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION

2.3.1 Immovable Property (includes gender)

71. Are the instructions regarding documents required to perform all types of property transfers publicly available? (Y/N)

 $Y \rightarrow$ Provide response to questions 72 and 73.

- 72. Are these instructions accessible online? (Y/N)
- 73. Are these instructions updated as soon as any changes occur? (Y/N)
- 74. Is the fee schedule for all types of property transfers at the immovable property registry publicly available? (Y/N)

 $Y \rightarrow Provide response to questions 75 and 76.$

- 75. Is this fee schedule accessible online? (Y/N)
- 76. Is this fee schedule updated as soon as any changes occur? (Y/N)
- 77. Does the immovable property registry publish online the estimated time it will take to deliver a legally binding document confirming property ownership? (Y/N)
- 78. Is the applicable fee schedule to access cadastral plans publicly available? (Y/N)

 $Y \rightarrow Provide response to questions 79 and 80.$

- 79. Is this fee schedule accessible online? (Y/N)
- 80. Is this fee schedule updated as soon as any changes occur? (Y/N)
- 81. Does the cadaster/mapping agency publish online the estimated time required to deliver a certified, up-to-date cadastral plan? (Y/N)
- 82. Are official statistics tracking the <u>number and type of transactions</u> at the land registry in [CITY] publicly available? (Y/N)

 $Y \rightarrow Provide response to questions 83 and 84.$

- 83. Are these statistics accessible online? (Y/N)
- 84. Are these statistics available for the most recent calendar year (2023)? (Y/N)
- 85. Are official statistics tracking the <u>number and type of land disputes</u> in [CITY] publicly available? (Y/N)

 $Y \rightarrow Provide response to questions 86, 87, and 88.$

- **86.** Are these statistics accessible online? (Y/N)
- 87. Are these statistics available for the most recent calendar year (2023)? (Y/N)
- 88. Are these publicly available statistics sex-disaggregated? (Y/N)
- 89. Are official statistics tracking the <u>average time it takes to resolve land disputes</u> in [CITY] publicly available? (Y/N)
- 90. Are these statistics accessible online? (Y/N)
- 91. Are these statistics available for the most recent calendar year (2023)? (Y/N)

 $N \rightarrow$ Provide response to question 96.

92. Are official statistics tracking <u>sex-disaggregated data on land ownership</u> in [CITY] publicly available? (Y/N)

 $Y \rightarrow$ Provide response to question 93, 94, 95, 96, and 97.

- 93. Are these statistics available for the most recent calendar year? (Y/N)
- 94. Are these statistics anonymized? (Y/N)

- 95. Are these statistics publicly available online? (Y/N)
- 96. Are these statistics on sex-disaggregated data differentiated by the following types of ownership: Sole Proprietorship? (Y/N)
- 97. Are these statistics on sex-disaggregated data differentiated by the following types of ownership: Joint Property? (Y/N)
- 98. Is information on the property tax value of all privately held properties in [CITY] publicly available? (Y/N)
 - $Y \rightarrow$ Provide response to question 99.
- 99. Is this information publicly available online? (Y/N)

2.3 TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION			
2.3.1 Immovable Property (includes gender)			
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Publication of Property Transactions Requirements - Available (71) AND	1	1	2
- Online (72) AND			
- Updated (73)			
Transparency of Property Transactions Costs	1	1	2
- Available (74) AND			
- Online (75) AND			
- Updated (76)			
Service Standards at the Immovable Property Registry (77)	1	1	2
Transparency of Cadaster Costs	1	1	2
- Available (78) AND			
- Online (79) AND			
- Updated (80)			
Service Standards for Cadaster (81)	1	1	2
Availability of Statistics on Land Transactions	1	1	2
- Available (82) AND			
- Online (83) AND			
- Updated (84)			
Availability of Statistics on Number and Type of Land Disputes	1	1	2
- Available (85) AND			
- Online (86) AND			
- Updated (87)			
Availability of Sex-Disaggregated Statistics on Number and Type of Land Disputes (88)	1	1	2
Availability of Statistics on Average Time Taken to Resolve Land	1	1	2
Disputes	1	1	2
- Available (89) AND			
- Online (90) AND			
- Updated (91)			
Availability of Sex-Disaggregated Data on Land Ownership	1	1	2
- Available (92) AND]	_	_
- Updated (93) AND			
- Anonymized (94) AND			

- Online (95)			
Availability of Sex-Disaggregated Data on Land Ownership by	1	1	2
Ownership Type			
- Sole Proprietorship (96)	0.5	0.5	1
- Joint Property (97)	0.5	0.5	1
Availability of Information on Property Tax Value	1	1	2
- Available (98) AND			
- Online (99)			
Total Points	12	12	24

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

PILLAR III-OPERATIONAL EFFICIENCY OF ESTABLISHING A BUSINESS LOCATION

The scores for Pillar III indicators are calculated using the Normal Cumulative Density Function (CDF) transformation method on a scale of 0 to 100, where 0 and 100 represent the lowest and highest possible scores, respectively. The best and worst performers are identified based on the 5th and 95th percentiles of the collected data.

Data for Pillar III on the Property Transfer and Land of Administration (Subcategory 3.1.1) are collected through firm-level surveys. Data for Pillar III on the Property Transfer and Land of Administration (Subcategory 3.1.2 and Subcategory 3.1.3) are collected through expert consultations using the following parameters:

Parameters	
Business Location	The largest (most populous) city in the economy. The parameter is used in cases where regulations may not be applicable at a national level and vary across states or regions. Geographical location determines selection of appropriate property registry in charge of property transfer. For all questions under Pillar III, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se.
Value of Property	For estimation of cost of property transfer, a parameter of value of property is provided (based on 100 times GNI [gross national income] per capita). This value of property is provided in local currency. For all questions under Pillar III, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter, unless specified otherwise in the question per se.
Other Parameters	Both selling and buying companies are owned by private nationals. Type of property under consideration is a commercial property. Transferring property might have a form of transferring state-owned land use rights, where applicable.

3.1 PROPERTY TRANSFER AND LAND ADMINISTRATION

- 100. On average, how many calendar days to complete due diligence clearance (such as encumbrance checking, title search, outstanding taxes search, bankruptcy search, company profile search, etc.), if mandatory or commonly done in practice? (not scored)
- 101. On average, what does it cost (in local currency) to complete due diligence clearance (such as encumbrance checking, title search, outstanding taxes search, bankruptcy search, company profile search, etc.), if mandatory or commonly done in practice? (not scored)

- 102. On average, how many calendar days does it take to review and sign the sale deed at notary/lawyer's office, if mandatory or commonly done in practice? (not scored)
- 103. On average, what does it cost (in local currency) to review and sign the sale deed at notary/lawyer's office, if mandatory or commonly done in practice? (not scored)
- 104. On average, how many calendar days does it take to complete payment of applicable fees and taxes? (not scored)
- 105. What is the amount of transfer tax (in local currency)? (not scored)
- 106. What is the amount of registration fees (in local currency)? (not scored)
- 107. What is the amount of stamp duty (in local currency)? (not scored)
- 108. What is the amount of other applicable fees and taxes (in local currency)? (not scored)
- 109. On average, how many calendar days does it take to complete the registration of transfer and issuance of new title/deed that enables the buyer to re-sell the property? (not scored)
- 110. On average, what does it cost (in local currency) to complete the registration of transfer and issuance of new title/deed that enables the buyer to re-sell the property (please consider only the costs that have not been considered previously)? (not scored)
- 111. Please mention what other step(s)/process(es) are required but not listed above. (not scored)
- 112. On average, how many calendar days does it take to complete this(ese) step(s)? (not scored)
- 113. On average, what does it cost (in local currency) to complete this(ese) step(s)? (not scored)
- 3.1.1 Major Constraints on Access to Land
- 114. To what degree is Access to Land an obstacle to the current operations of this establishment? (0 no obstacle, 1 minor obstacle, 2 moderate obstacle, 3 major obstacle to 4 very severe obstacle)
- 3.1.2 Time to Transfer a Property
- 115. What is the total time to complete the entire process to transfer the ownership of a commercial property from one domestic company to another domestic company (in calendar days)?
- 3.1.3 Cost to Transfer a Property
- 116. What is the total cost to complete the entire property transfer process between two domestic companies (in local currency)?
- 117. What is the total cost to complete the entire property transfer process between two domestic companies (as percentage of total property value)? (not scored)

3.1 PROPERTY TRANSFER AND LAND ADMINISTRATION			
3.1.1 Major Constraints on Access to Land			
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Major Constraints on Access to Land (114)	100 (100%)	n/a	100 (100%)
Total Points for Subcategory 3.1.1	100	n/a	100
3.1.2 Time to Transfer a Property			
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Time to Transfer a Property (115) Also corroborated with 100, 102, 104, 109, 112	100 (100%)	n/a	100 (100%)
Total Points for Subcategory 3.1.2	100	n/a	100
3.1.3 Cost to Transfer a Property			
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Cost to Transfer a Property (116) Also corroborated with 101, 103, 105-108, 110, 113, 117	100 (100%)	n/a	100 (100%)
Total Points for Subcategory 3.1.3	100	n/a	100
Total Points for Category 3.1	100	n/a	100

Note: n/a = not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent). FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

BUILDING PERMITS QUESTIONNAIRE

The tables that follow present all indicators (including their components, if applicable) under each pillar, with a reference to the corresponding question number in parenthesis. The questions are listed before each table for ease of reference.

For Y/N questions, the Y response accounts for the score and is considered as the good practice, unless otherwise indicated with the sign "Y/N; N - good practice".

In the tables that follow, "AND" means all referenced questions must have a good practice response to obtain a score on the indicator.

In the tables that follow, "OR" means one or more referenced questions must have a good practice response to obtain a score on the indicator.

Certain questions are marked as "not scored," which indicates that they do not affect the score in any way. The purpose of these questions is to further inform and refine the questions design for subsequent years of the rollout phase, as needed, as well as to substantiate and provide further information for the scored questions.

PILLAR I–QUALITY OF REGULATIONS FOR BUSINESS LOCATION			
Parameters			
Business Location	The largest (most populous) city in the economy. The parameter is used in cases where regulations may not be applicable at a national level and vary across states or regions. Geographic location determines the relevant regulatory framework governing building and environmental permits. In many economies, legislation governing building and environmental permits is defined at city and municipal level. For Pillar I, if regulations differ across states within an economy, the experts will be asked to provide information regarding regulations of the largest city.		

1.2 BUILDING, ZONING AND LAND USE

1.2.1 Building Standards

Does the legal framework in [ECONOMY] include the following building standards or codes? (questions 1 through 9)

- 1. Structural Resilience of construction standard (e.g., to safeguard against earthquakes or other natural disasters) (Y/N)
- 2. Fire Safety standard that needs to be adhered to in all construction (Y/N)
- 3. Accessibility and Inclusivity standard applicable to all construction (Y/N)
- 4. Health and Sanitation Requirements standard applicable to all construction (Y/N)
- 5. Energy Efficiency in Building Design and Sustainability standard applicable to all construction (Y/N)

- 6. Building Classification standard (i.e. criteria for categorizing buildings based on their use, occupancy type, and size) (Y/N)
- 7. Land Use Regulations standard (i.e. zoning regulations to govern land use, density, setbacks, and other development parameters) (Y/N)
- 8. Quality Assurance Inspections and Compliance Enforcement standard in all construction (Y/N)
- 9. Maintenance and Renovation Requirements standard applicable to all construction (Y/N)
- 10. Is there a National Building Code or equivalent framework in [ECONOMY] that encompasses all legislation, regulations, and standards pertaining to building construction? (Y/N)
- 11. Does the legal framework require permits for handling, removing, or disposing of hazardous construction materials (e.g., asbestos, lead, mercury devices, or polychlorinated biphenyls)? (Y/N)
- 12. Based on the legal framework, is there a public agency (such as the building control agency), responsible for verifying that building plans comply with existing building regulations? (Y/N)
- 13. Based on the legal framework, are architectural and engineering firms, hired by the builder as independent third-party professionals, responsible for ensuring that building plans comply with current building regulations? (Y/N)
- 14. Based on the legal framework, is an architect or engineer required to conduct technical supervisions/inspections of construction projects? (Y/N)

 $Y \rightarrow$ Provide response to questions 15 to 17.

Which of the following conditions, if any, are required in order for a professional being eligible to conduct technical inspections of construction projects: (questions 15 through 17)

- 15. A mandatory exam (besides the university degree) (Y/N)
- **16.** Minimum number of years of practical experience (Y/N)
- 17. Being a registered member of the order (association) of architects or civil engineers (Y/N)
- 18. Does the law mandate inspections on a regular basis (weekly, monthly, quarterly) or during different phases of the construction process to assure structural safety? (Y/N)
- 19. Does the law mandate different types of inspections during construction to assure structural safety depending on the risk level of the construction and its use (risk-based inspections)? (Y/N)

Who is legally responsible for conducting these inspections during construction? (questions 20 through 25)

- 20. Self-certification (i.e. building company inspects itself)? (Y/N)
- 21. A third-party engineer or engineering firm? (Y/N)
- 22. Governmental agencies, such as the municipal building department? (Y/N)

- 23. Is a final inspection of the construction required by law before a building can be occupied? (Y/N)
- 24. Does the law regulate liability when structural defects are detected after the completion of a construction project? (Y/N)
- 25. Is liability for structural defects defined only in the contract between the involved parties, rather than by law? (Y/N)

Based on the legal framework, who can be held liable for structural problems that surface during or after construction of a building? (questions 26 through 28)

- 26. Architects or engineers from the construction company? (Y/N)
- 27. A third-party engineer or engineering firm that conducted the inspections during construction? (Y/N)
- 28. The government agency, such as the municipal building department? (Y/N)
- 29. Is an occupancy permit required by law before a building can be occupied? (Y/N)
- 30. Does the legal framework mandate that appeals regarding building permits, inspections, or compliance be handled by an independent third-party agency? (Y/N)

What authority is conferred by the law to a building control agency, in charge of enforcing building regulations? (questions 31 through 34)

- 31. The authority to issue an emergency order to address immediate safety concerns of a building? $(Y\!/\!N)$
- 32. The authority to issue orders to vacate premises for non-compliance with building regulations? (Y/N)
- 33. The authority to initiate prosecution in a court of competent jurisdiction for violations of building codes? (Y/N)
- 34. The authority to recommend the suspension or cancellation of licenses for non-compliant building practitioners to the registration body? (Y/N)

1.2.2 Building Energy Standards

- 35. Is the builder legally required to implement minimum energy-efficiency performance standards (such as building insulation, lighting and HVAC systems, or other) outlined in the building code or in any other building regulations? (Y/N)
- 36. Have the building energy codes or standards in [ECONOMY] been updated within the past 10 years? (not scored) (Y/N)

When applying for a building permit, which of the following are mandatory checks to be done? (questions 37 through 48)

- 37. Compliance with energy-efficiency standards. (not scored) (Y/N)
- $N \rightarrow Provide response to question 49.$
- 38. Thermal transmittance or insulation calculations for the building envelope (Y/N)
- 39. Solar heat gain calculations for the building envelope (Y/N)

- **40.** Glazing factors for fenestration (Y/N)
- 41. Heating and cooling demand calculations (Y/N)
- 42. Daylighting and orientation aspects (Y/N)
- 43. Permanent shading (Y/N)
- 44. Air barrier, air leakage, or air infiltration (Y/N)
- 45. Efficiency of heating and cooling equipment and controls (Y/N)
- 46. Water heating equipment and controls efficiency (Y/N)
- 47. Lighting fixtures and controls efficiency (Y/N)
- 48. Insulation and heat traps (Y/N)
- 49. Based on the legal framework, are builders provided with either financial incentives (such as tax breaks and grants) or non-financial incentives (such as expedited permit processing or density bonuses) to promote the adoption of green building standards in new construction projects? (Y/N)

1.2.3 Zoning and Land Use Regulations

Based on the legal framework, please indicate which features are included in the land use planning/zoning regulations for [CITY]: (questions 50 through 54)

- 50. Requirements for essential infrastructure such as water supply, electricity, sanitation or drainage systems as prerequisites for land development (Y/N)
- 51. Requirement of a land use map that identifies different zoning categories, such as residential, commercial, agricultural, recreational, public/institutional, or mixed use (Y/N)
- 52. Requirement for hazard maps which identify areas where construction is not permitted due to natural hazards $(Y\!/\!N)$
- 53. Requirement for hazard maps, which identify minimum separation between residential and hazardous occupancies (Y/N)
- 54. Requirement for maps that identify areas where construction is prohibited due to considerations such as conservation areas, water bodies, environmentally sensitive zones, or other natural resource-related factors (Y/N)

1.2 BUILDING, ZONING AND LAND USE			
1.2.1 Building Standards			
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Building Codes/Standards Applicable to All Constructions (10)	1	1	2

Clear Provisions or Guidelines Regarding Safety Standards	n/a	1	1
- Structural Resilience (1)	n/a	0.11	0.11
- Fire Safety (2)	n/a	0.11	0.11
- Accessibility and Inclusivity (3)	n/a	0.11	0.11
- Health and Sanitation (4)	n/a	0.11	0.11
- Energy Efficiency in Building Design and Sustainability (5)	n/a	0.11	0.11
- Building Classification (6)	n/a	0.11	0.11
	n/a	0.11	0.11
- Land Use Regulations (7)		-	
- Quality Assurance Inspections and Compliance Enforcement (8)	n/a	0.11	0.11
- Maintenance and Renovation Requirements (9)	n/a	0.11	0.11
Regulation of Health Risk Related to Construction Materials (11)	n/a	1	1
Responsibility for Compliance with Legal Requirements	1	1	2
- Public agency responsibility (12) OR			
- Third-party architectural and engineering firms responsibility (13)			
Qualifications to Conduct Technical Supervision/Inspections	1	1	2
- Is an architect or engineer (14)			
- Requirement of a mandatory exam (15) OR	0.50	0.50	1
- Years of practical experience (16) OR	0.50	0.50	
- Being a registered member of a professional association (17)	0.50	0.50	1
- Being a registered member of a professional association (17)	0.50	0.50	1
	1	1	2
Type of Inspections Carried Out During Construction	1	1	2
- Inspections during various phases (18)	0.50	0.50	1
- Risk-based inspections (19)	0.50	0.50	1
1 , ,	0.50	0.50	<u>l</u>
Responsibility for Conducting Inspections During Construction	1	1	2
- Self-certification by the building company (20)			
- Third-party engineer or engineering firm (21)	0.33	0.33	0.67
- Governmental agencies (22)	0.33	0.33	0.67
	0.33	0.33	0.67
Requirement of Final Inspection by Law (23)	1	1	2
Liability for Structural Flaws/Problems	1	1	2
- Liability of construction company architect or engineer (26) OR			
- Liability of third-party inspectors (27) OR			
- Liability of government agencies (28)			
	1	1	2
Occupancy Permit (29)	1	1	2
Ability to Dispute Building Permit Decisions (30)	1	1	2
Building Control Agency Authority	1	1	2
- Authority to Issue Emergency Orders (31)	0.25	0.25	0.5
- Authority to Issue Orders to Vacate (32)	0.25	0.25	0.5
- Authority to Initiate Prosecution (33)	0.25	0.25	0.5
- Authority to Inflate Prosecution (33) - Authority to Recommend Suspension or Cancellation of Licenses	0.25	0.25	0.5
(34)	0.23	0.23	0.5
Total Points	10	12	22
1.2.2 Building Energy Standards	10		
	T		Total
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Points
Mandatory Minimum Energy Efficiency Performance Standards	n/a	1	1
(35)	1 -	1	1
Energy Efficiency Performance Standards are Verified as Part of	n/a	1	1
the Building Permit Review Process			
 Thermal transmittance or insulation calculations (38) Solar heat gain calculations for building envelope (39) 	n/a	0.09	0.09

 Glazing factors for fenestration (40) Heating/cooling demand calculations (41) Daylighting and orientation (42) 	n/a	0.00	
	11/ a	0.09	0.09
- Daylighting and orientation (42)	n/a	0.09	0.09
Dayinghang and orientation (12)	n/a	0.09	0.09
- Permanent shading (43)	n/a	0.09	0.09
- Air barrier, air leakage or air infiltration (44)	n/a	0.09	0.09
- Efficiency of heating and cooling equipment and controls (45)	n/a	0.09	0.09
- Efficiency of water heating equipment and controls (46)	n/a	0.09	0.09
- Efficiency of lighting fixtures and controls (47)	n/a	0.09	0.09
- Insulation and heat traps (48)	n/a	0.09	0.09
1 (/	n/a	0.09	0.09
Incentives to Promote Green Building Standards (49)	n/a	1	1
Total Points	n/a	3	3
1.2.3 Zoning and Land Use Regulations			
	1		
Indicators	EED	CDD	Total
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total points
Indicators Requirements for Essential Infrastructure Service Access (Water,	FFP 1	SBP	
			points
Requirements for Essential Infrastructure Service Access (Water,			points
Requirements for Essential Infrastructure Service Access (Water, Electricity, Sanitation) (50)	1	1	points 2
Requirements for Essential Infrastructure Service Access (Water, Electricity, Sanitation) (50) Maps that Identify Areas Allocated to Residential, Commercial,	1	1	points 2
Requirements for Essential Infrastructure Service Access (Water, Electricity, Sanitation) (50) Maps that Identify Areas Allocated to Residential, Commercial, Agricultural, Recreational, Public/Institutional, Mixed use (51)	1	1	points 2
Requirements for Essential Infrastructure Service Access (Water, Electricity, Sanitation) (50) Maps that Identify Areas Allocated to Residential, Commercial, Agricultural, Recreational, Public/Institutional, Mixed use (51) Hazard Maps that Identify Areas in which Building is not	1	1	points 2
Requirements for Essential Infrastructure Service Access (Water, Electricity, Sanitation) (50) Maps that Identify Areas Allocated to Residential, Commercial, Agricultural, Recreational, Public/Institutional, Mixed use (51) Hazard Maps that Identify Areas in which Building is not Permitted due to Natural Hazards (52)	1 1	1 1	points 2 2 2
Requirements for Essential Infrastructure Service Access (Water, Electricity, Sanitation) (50) Maps that Identify Areas Allocated to Residential, Commercial, Agricultural, Recreational, Public/Institutional, Mixed use (51) Hazard Maps that Identify Areas in which Building is not Permitted due to Natural Hazards (52) Hazard Maps that Identify Minimum Separation between	1 1	1 1	points 2 2 2
Requirements for Essential Infrastructure Service Access (Water, Electricity, Sanitation) (50) Maps that Identify Areas Allocated to Residential, Commercial, Agricultural, Recreational, Public/Institutional, Mixed use (51) Hazard Maps that Identify Areas in which Building is not Permitted due to Natural Hazards (52) Hazard Maps that Identify Minimum Separation between Residential and Hazardous Occupancies (53)	1 1 1	1 1 1	points 2 2 2 2 2

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

PILLAR II-QUALITY OF PUB BUSINESS LOCATION	LIC SERVICES AND TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION FOR
Parameters	
Business Location	The largest (most populous) city in the economy. The parameter is used in cases where regulations may not be applicable at a national level and vary across states or regions. Geographic location determines the relevant regulatory framework governing building and environmental permits. In many economies, legislation governing building and environmental permits is defined at city and municipal level. For all questions in Pillar II, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se.

2.1 AVAILABILITY AND RELIABITY OF DIGITAL SERVICES

2.1.4 Building Permits–Digital Public Services

- 55. Does [CITY] have an online platform that allows the Planning/Building Control Agency to process and issue building authorizations (such as planning approvals, building permits, and/or occupancy permits)? (not scored) (Y/N)
- 56. Which of the following best describes the level of integration of the planning/building control agency's online platform with other related agencies, such as the land registry, cadaster or utility service providers (please select one answer option that applies)?

- 56a. The online platform does not integrate any relevant authorizations from agencies outside of the planning/building control agency
- 56b. The online platform integrates some relevant authorizations from agencies outside of the planning/building control agency (but not all)
- 56c. The online platform fully integrates authorizations from all relevant agencies from organizations outside of the planning/building control agency

Please specify if the following features are available in the online platform: (questions 57 through 63)

- 57. Online payment of fees for obtaining the building permit and/or occupancy permit through the online platform (Y/N)
- 58. Online communication between users and the authorities regarding permit applications (Y/N)
- 59. Online notifications to keep users informed about application status updates or actions required (Y/N)
- 60. Submission of applications or documents required to obtain a building permit? (Y/N)
- 61. Auto-generated checklist to help users ensure that they have completed all necessary steps to submit a building permit application (Y/N)
- 62. Submission of the building permit application package and issuance of building permits (Y/N)
- 63. Submission of the occupancy permit application package and issuance of occupancy permits (Y/N)
- 64. Can final decisions by the building control agency on building permits be appealed online? (Y/N)

2.1 AVAILABILITY AND RELIABILITY OF DIGITAL SERVICES					
2.1.4 Building Permits-Digital Public Services					
Indicators FFP SBP Total Points					
Online Platform for Issuing Building Authorizations	1	1	2		
- Online platform for building authorizations and full integration of	1 OR	1 OR	2 OR		
authorizations from all relevant agencies from organizations outside					
of the planning/building control agency (56c) OR					
- Online platform for building authorizations and integration of some	0.5	0.5	1		
relevant authorizations from agencies outside of the					
planning/building control agency (56b)					
Online Permitting Systems with Several Functionalities	1	1	2		
- Online payment of fees (57)	0.2	0.2	0.4		
- Online communication (58)	0.2	0.2	0.4		
- Online notifications (59)	0.2	0.2	0.4		
- Online submission (60)	0.2	0.2	0.4		
- Auto-generated checklist (61)	0.2	0.2	0.4		
Online Permitting Systems to Obtain Building and Occupancy	1	1	2		
Permits					
- Building permit can be obtained online (62)	0.5	0.5	1		
- Occupancy permit can be obtained online (63)	0.5	0.5	1		
File Dispute Online on Building Permits (64)	1	1	2		
Total Points	4	4	8		

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

2.2 INTEROPERABILITY OF SERVICES

2.2.2 Interoperability of Services for Building Permits

- 65. Are spatial plans and zoning requirements accessible to developers and architects in the form of a Geographic Information System (GIS) or other spatial data platforms? (Please select one answer option that applies)
 - 65a. Yes, available online for information purposes (not valid for official procedures)
 - 65b. Yes, available from a local or central system (e.g., national spatial planning system, GIS, or registry of urban plans) and is valid for official procedures
 - 65c. Not available digitally → Provide response to question 66.
- 66. Is there full integration of GIS and/or national spatial platforms between the building permitissuing agency and other stakeholder agencies (e.g., cadaster, land registries, municipal departments, utility service providers, etc.)?
 - 66a. Yes, fully integrated with all relevant stakeholders
 - 66b. No integration

2.2 INTEROPERABILITY OF SERVICES			
2.2.2 Interoperability of Services for Building Permits			
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Availability of Spatial Plans and Zoning Requirements to all Stakeholders (65b)	1	1	2
Integration of GIS or National Spatial Platforms	1	1	2
Fully integrated (66a)	1	1	2
Total Points	2	2	4

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; GIS = Geographic Information System; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

2.3 TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION

2.3.2 Building, Zoning and Land Use

Please specify which of the following information us made available online by the building permitting agencies: (questions 67 through 71)

- 67. Building control regulations, accessible to all stakeholders, including residents, developers, architects, and other interested parties (Y/N)
- 68. Detailed criteria and steps necessary to obtain building permits (e.g., documentation, fees, technical specifications) (Y/N)
- 69. List of approvals required prior to obtaining a building permit from local service providers (like water utilities, electricity providers, etc.) (Y/N)
- 70. List of documents required to apply for a building permit (e.g., land ownership certificate, types of drawings and plans) (Y/N)
- 71. List of documents required to apply for an occupancy permit (Y/N)

72. An updated fee schedule for all types of construction (Please select one answer option that applies)

- 72a. Yes, available online and updated regularly
- 72b. Available online but not updated regularly
- 72c. No, not available to the public

73. Official, updated statistics tracking the number of building permits issued? (Y/N) (Not scored)

74. Has the master plan/zoning plan of [CITY] been revised or amended within the last 10 years?

- 74a. Yes
- 74b. There is a master plan/zoning plan, but it has not been updated within the last 10 years
- 74c. There is no master plan/zoning plan in [CITY] → Provide response to question 76.

75. Are there official procedures and steps specifically defined for the relevant authority to follow when modifying the master plan/zoning plan in [CITY]? (Y/N)

76. How is adherence to zoning regulations verified before submitting a building permit application in [CITY] (please select one answer option that applies)?

- 76a. Zoning compliance can be verified by the builder through accessible online zoning maps, and is further checked by the permit issuing authority upon receipt of the building permit application, with no additional involvement required from the builder
- 76b. Builder obtains formal urban planning approval from planning agency before obtaining building permit

76c. Zoning regulations adherence is not verified

2.3 TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION				
2.3.2 Building, Zoning and Land use				
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points	
Public Accessibility of Planning and Building Control Regulations (67)	1	1	2	
Public Online Availability of Requirements to Obtain all Types of	1	1	2	
Building Related Permits				
- Detailed criteria and steps necessary to obtain building permits (68)	0.33	0.33	0.67	
- List of approvals required prior to obtaining a building permit from	0.33	0.33	0.67	
local service providers (69)				
- List of documents required to apply for a building permit (70)		0.33	0.67	
Public Online Availability of Requirements Needed to Obtain		1	2	
Occupancy Permit (71)				
Applicable Fee Schedules for all Types of Construction Publicly Available and Up to Date (72a)	1	1	2	
Availability of Official, Updated and Publicly Available Online		1	2	
Statistics Tracking the Number of Issued Building Permits (73)				
Updated City Master Plan/Zoning Plan (74)	1	1	2	
Steps to Modify Zoning/Land Use Plan (75)	1	1	2	
Adherence to Zoning Regulations (76a OR 76b)	1	1	2	
Total Points	8	8	16	

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

PILLAR III-OPERATIONAL EFFICIENCY OF ESTABLISHING A BUSINESS LOCATION

The scores for Pillar III indicators are calculated using the Normal Cumulative Density Function (CDF) transformation method on a scale of 0 to 100, where 0 and 100 represent the lowest and highest possible scores, respectively. The best and worst performers are identified based on the 5th and 95th percentiles of the collected data.

The data for Pillar III on the operational efficiency in obtaining a construction-related permit is collected through firm level surveys, using the following parameters:

PILLAR III-OPERATION	AL EFFICIENCY OF ESTABLISHING A BUSINESS LOCATION
Parameters	
Business Location	The largest (most populous) city in the economy. The parameter is used in cases where regulations may not be applicable at a national level and vary across states or regions. Geographical location determines the selection of regulatory framework at municipal and sub-national level. For all questions under Pillar III, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se.
Largest Municipality	The largest municipality with the largest number of customers served. The selection of municipality affects the responses provided by experts on the operational efficiency of services provided. For all questions under Pillar III, the experts will be asked to identify the largest municipality and to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se.
Type and Size of Building	Building regulations, type and level of pre-approvals, documents to be submitted and fees vary depending on the type of construction being permitted (typically classified as residential, commercial or industrial). The size of building affects the cost of permitting and in some cases, it can affect the number of inspections to be conducted during construction. Some specific parameters to be considered for the operational efficiency of obtaining a building permit in practice: - Type of building: commercial building that will be used for offices - Size of commercial building: 1,800 square meters (19,375 square feet) - Floors height of commercial building: 5 floors (each floor is 360 square meters (3,875 square feet9 ft and 10 inches) high) Each floor is assumed to be 3 meters high (9ft 10 inches) - Land plot: 603.8 square meters 6,500 sq feet (603.8 square meters 6,500 square feet) No activity will be performed in the premises of the office building that would require clearances, permits and inspections due to the existence of hazardous or other regulated materials.

3.2 CONSTRUCTION PERMITS

77. Please specify the municipality that would review and approve the building permit (in case of multiple municipalities in [CITY]): (not scored)

Preparation of Building Permits

Please fill out the information below for all steps officially required and/or commonly done in practice to obtain a building permit to construct an office building. Please assume that the building company has an

internal architect/ engineer and only count the steps that the building company has to do with external private or public parties.

When providing the time and the cost, please consider the time for each step and whether they can be done simultaneously with another process, excluding the time it takes for the architect or engineer to complete the required projects for the building permit. Additionally, when applicable, provide the official costs for each step only.

Please provide your response below for each of the steps required to obtain a building permit, in practice.

- 78. Is an ownership/property certificate required or commonly done in practice? (Y/N) (not scored) N → Provide response to question 81.
- 79. How many calendar days does it take to obtain an ownership/property certificate? (not scored)
- 80. On average, how much does it cost to complete this step? (not scored)
- 81. Is a topographical survey required or commonly done in practice? (Y/N) (not scored) N → Provide response to question 84.
- 82. How many calendar days does it take to carry out or commission a topographical survey? (Y/N) (not scored)
- 83. On average, how much does it cost to complete this step? (not scored)
- 84. Is obtaining a geotechnical investigation required or commonly done in practice? (not scored) N → Provide response to question 87.
- 85. How many calendar days does it take to commission and obtain a geotechnical investigation? (not scored)
- 86. On average, how much does it cost to complete this step? (not scored)
- 87. Is an urban planning approval certificate required or commonly done in practice? (not scored) N → Provide response to question 90.
- 88. How many calendar days does it take to receive an urban planning approval certificate?
- 89. On average, how much does it cost to complete this step? (not scored)
- 90. Is it mandatory to obtain a certificate of compliance from utility service providers on the technical conditions to ensure the safety of construction activities and to prevent damage to existing utility infrastructure? (not scored)

 $N \rightarrow Provide response to question 93.$

- 91. How many calendar days does it take to obtain the certificate of compliance from utility providers? (not scored)
- 92. On average, how much does it cost to complete this step? (not scored)

- 93. Are inspections by any agency prior to the issuing of a building permit required or commonly done in practice? (not scored)
 - $N \rightarrow$ Provide response to question 96.
- 94. How many calendar days does it take to carry out such inspections? (not scored)
- 95. On average, how much does it cost to complete this step? (not scored)
- **96.** Please comment if there are any other steps that are required or commonly done in *practice* (not scored)

3.2.1 Time to Obtain a Construction-Related Permit

- 97. Over the last two years, did this establishment apply for a construction-related permit? (not scored)
- 98. Time to obtain a construction-related permit: in reference to the most recent application, approximately how many days did it take to obtain the construction-related permit from the date of the application to the day the permit was granted?

3.2.2 Time to Obtain a Building Permit

99. What is the <u>total number of calendar days</u> to complete the entire process to obtain a building permit for a commercial property that will be used as an office building under the scenario described above?

3.2.3 Cost to Obtain a Building Permit

100. What is the <u>total cost</u> to complete the entire process of obtaining a building permit for a commercial property that will be used as an office building under the scenario described above?

3.2 CONSTRUCTION PERMITS					
3.2.1 Time to Obtain a Construction-Related Permit					
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points		
Time to Obtain a Construction-Related Permit (98)	100 (100%)	n/a	100 (100%)		
Total Points for Subcategory 3.2.1	100	n/a	100		
3.2.2 Time to Obtain a Building Permit					
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points		
Time to Obtain a Building Permit (99) Further corroborated with data from 79, 82, 85, 88, 91,94	100 (100%)	n/a	100 (100%)		
Total Points for Subcategory 3.2.2 100 n/a 10					
3.2.3 Cost to Obtain a Building Permit					
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points		
Cost to Obtain a Building Permit (100) Further corroborated with data from 80, 83, 86, 89, 92, 95	100 (100%)	n/a	100 (100%)		
Total Points for Subcategory 3.2.3	100	n/a	100		
Total Points for Category 3.2	100	n/a	100		

Note: n/a = not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent). FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

ENVIRONMENTAL PERMITS QUESTIONNAIRE

The tables that follow present all indicators (including their components, if applicable) under each pillar, with a reference to the corresponding question number in parenthesis. The questions are listed before each table for ease of reference.

For Y/N questions, the Y response accounts for the score and is considered as the good practice, unless otherwise indicated with the sign "Y/N; N - good practice".

In the tables that follow, "AND" means all referenced questions must have a good practice response to obtain a score on the indicator.

In the tables that follow, "OR" means one or more referenced questions must have a good practice response to obtain a score on the indicator.

Certain questions are marked as "not scored," which indicates that they do not affect the score in any way. The purpose of these questions is to further inform and refine the questions design for subsequent years of the rollout phase, as needed, as well as to substantiate and provide further information for the scored questions.

PILLAR I-QUALITY OF REGULATIONS FOR BUSINESS LOCATION			
Parameters			
Business Location	The largest (most populous) city in the economy. Geographical location determines the relevant regulatory framework governing environmental permits. For Pillar I, if regulations differ across states within an economy, the experts will be asked to provide information regarding regulations of the largest city.		
Type and Size of Project	The type and size of project (housing development project) determines the type of environmental permitting required. A specific parameter of the construction of a new residential dwelling housing development project is provided, with a total surface area of residential housing development project of 10 acres (40,468 sqm). The type of residence considered is detached single family house with 1, 2, and 3 bedrooms, each with its own driveway, and the estimated number of houses are 100 single family homes, with an estimated 600 residents.		

1.4 ENVIRONMENTAL PERMITS

1.4.1 Environmental Permits for Construction

1. Does the legal framework in [ECONOMY] classify building construction projects based on their potential environmental impact? (Y/N) (not scored)

 $Y \rightarrow$ Provide response to questions 2-7.

Does the legal framework in [ECONOMY] address the following environmental risks associated with building construction projects? (questions 2 through 7)

2. Risks that may affect biodiversity and natural resources, potentially threatening the protection, conservation, maintenance, and restoration of natural habitats and biodiversity, including ecosystems, protected areas, and forests. (Y/N)

- 3. Risks that may contribute to greenhouse gas emissions or climate change impacts. (Y/N)
- 4. Risks that may cause physical or biological hazards, such as contamination of air, water, soil, or noise. (Y/N)
- 5. Risks that may require pest management measures, such as pesticides or other chemicals. (Y/N)
- 6. Risks that may generate or release pollutants, such as wastewater, solid waste, or air emissions, and require measures to prevent or mitigate pollution. (Y/N)
- 7. Risks that may affect water resources, including water quality, quantity, and access, and require measures to manage and conserve water resources. (Y/N)
- 8. Does the legal framework mandate permits to prevent <u>pollution (air, water, soil)</u> during or from construction projects in the building industry? (Y/N)

 $Y \rightarrow$ Provide response to question 9.

- 9. Have penalties or fines been established to enforce compliance? (Y/N)
- 10. Does the legal framework mandate permits to govern <u>extraction of water resources</u> during or from construction projects in the building industry? (Y/N)

 $Y \rightarrow$ Provide response to question 11.

- 11. Have penalties or fines been established to enforce compliance? (Y/N)
- 12. Does the legal framework mandate permits to govern <u>waste management and recycling</u> during or from construction projects in the building industry? (Y/N)

 $Y \rightarrow$ Provide response to question 13.

- 13. Have penalties or fines been established to enforce compliance? (Y/N)
- 14. Does the legal framework mandate permits to govern <u>wastewater treatment</u> during or from construction projects in the building industry? (Y/N)

 $Y \rightarrow$ Provide response to question 15.

15. Have penalties or fines been established to enforce compliance? (Y/N)

According to the legal framework, which of the following criteria triggers an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) in [CITY] for a building construction project? (questions 16 through 19)

16. Size of the project (e.g., surface area of the project, number of floors, parking lots) (Y/N)

- 17. Geographical location of the project (e.g., environmentally sensitive locations, cultural heritage) (Y/N)
- 18. Nature of the project (e.g., type of construction, industrial vs. residential use) (Y/N)
- 19. Environmental impact (e.g., changes to land use, pollution, human health and safety) (Y/N)

- 20. Does the legal framework require that all projects, including those categorized as having a low environmental impact, must obtain an environmental approval by a public entity? (Y/N)
- 21. Is it mandatory by law that an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) must be conducted by a qualified professional or professional agency? (Y/N)

Based on the existing legal framework, does the EIA process include each of the following requirements? (questions 22 through 26)

- 22. Scoping (identification of the scope of the assessment, including the issues to be addressed and the potential environmental impacts of the proposed project) (Y/N)
- 23. Impact assessment (identification and evaluation of the potential positive and negative environmental impacts of the proposed project, including direct and indirect impacts, short-term and long-term impacts, and cumulative impacts) (Y/N)
- 24. Mitigation measures (development of measures to avoid, minimize, or compensate for the negative environmental impacts of the proposed project, and enhancement of positive impacts) (Y/N)
- 25. Public consultation (community engagement through the disclosure of project-related information, consultation, and the incorporation of feedback, particularly from affected communities. This also includes providing project-based grievance mechanisms. Information will be disclosed in a timely manner, in an accessible place, and in a format and language understandable to both project-affect parties and other interested stakeholders) (Y/N)
- 26. Monitoring and follow-up (Implementation of a monitoring program to verify the accuracy of the impact predictions, and to ensure that the mitigation measures are effective in reducing the negative environmental impacts) (Y/N)
- 27. Is the public disclosure of relevant information from Environmental Impact Assessments (EIAs) (i.e. Environmental Impact Statement) mandatory by law? (Y/N)

Does the legal framework for Environmental Impact Assessments (EIAs) require the following activities and approaches to enable stakeholders to contribute to the decision making? (questions 28 through 30)

- 28. Relevant information for EIA clearance is provided in formats and languages that are understandable and accessible to both project-affected and other interested parties. (Y/N)
- 29. Relevant information for EIA clearance is provided in accessible places, online, gazettes and media. (Y/N)
- 30. Capacity-building activities (such as training, resources, and technical assistance) are offered (Y/N)
- 31. According to the legal framework, are Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) reports subject to a review by a responsible authority or body? (Y/N)
 Y → Provide response to question 32.
- 32. Does the legal framework for Environmental Impact Assessments (EIAs) offer formal guidelines and procedures for the EIA review process? (Y/N)

- 33. Is it legally required that the formal review of EIAs be conducted by a qualified professional or an expert in EIAs? (Y/N)
- 34. Can the final decisions on EIAs be legally enforced through penalties, fines, and other mechanisms? (Y/N)
- 35. If a project causes environmental damage, can either the approving authority of an EIA or the project developer/owner be held liable? (Y/N)

1.4.2 Dispute Resolution Mechanism for EIA Decisions

- 36. According to the legal framework, can EIA decisions in [ECONOMY] be disputed or appealed by affected parties? (Y/N)
- 37. According to the legal framework, is arbitration offered as an out-of-court resolution mechanism for affected parties to dispute the EIA or environmental permits decisions with public bodies in [ECONOMY]? (Y/N)
- 38. According to the legal framework, is conciliation or mediation offered as an out-of-court resolution mechanism for affected parties to dispute EIA or environmental permits decisions with public bodies in [ECONOMY]? (Y/N)

1.4 ENVIRONMENTAL PERMITS				
1.4.1 Environmental Permits for Construction				
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points	
Environmental Risks as Defined by Legal Framework	n/a	1	1	
- Risks that may affect biodiversity and natural resources (2)	n/a	0.167	0.167	
- Risks that may contribute to greenhouse gas emissions or climate	n/a	0.167	0.167	
change impacts (3)				
- Risks that may cause physical or biological hazards, such as	n/a	0.167	0.167	
contamination of air, water, soil, or noise (4)				
- Risks that may require pest management measures (5)	n/a	0.167	0.167	
- Risks that may generate or release pollutants (6)	n/a	0.167	0.167	
- Risks that may affect water resources, including water quality,	n/a	0.167	0.167	
quantity, and access (7)				
Environmental Permits Requirements for Construction	n/a	1	1	
- Permits to prevent pollution (air, water, soil) (8)	n/a	0.25	0.25	
- Permits to govern extraction of water resources (10)	n/a	0.25	0.25	
- Permits to govern waste management and recycling (12)	n/a	0.25	0.25	
- Permits to govern wastewater treatment (14)	n/a	0.25	0.25	
Enforcement Mechanism for Environmental Permits	n/a	1	1	
- Penalties or fines established for permits to prevent pollution (air,	n/a	0.25	0.25	
water, soil) (9)				
- Penalties or fines established for permits to govern extraction of	n/a	0.25	0.25	
water resources (11)				
- Penalties or fines established for permits to govern waste	n/a	0.25	0.25	
management and recycling (13)				
- Penalties or fines established for permits to govern wastewater	n/a	0.25	0.25	
treatment (15)				

Qualified Professional/Professional Agency to Conduct EIA (21)	n/a	1	1
Criteria that Trigger an EIA	n/a	1	1
- Extent (size) of project (16)	n/a	0.25	0.25
- Geographical location (17)	n/a	0.25	0.25
- Nature of the project (18)	n/a	0.25	0.25
- Environmental impact (19)	n/a	0.25	0.25
EIA for projects with low environmental impacts (20)	n/a	1	1
Requirements for an EIA Process	n/a	1	1
- Scoping and baseline studies (22)	n/a	0.2	0.2
- Impact assessment (23)	n/a	0.2	0.2
- Mitigation measures (24)	n/a	0.2	0.2
- Public participation (25)	n/a	0.2	0.2
- Monitoring and follow-up (26)	n/a	0.2	0.2
Legal Responsibility for Checking Compliance	n/a	1	1
- EIA is subject to review (31)	n/a	0.5	0.5
- EIA offer formal guidelines and procedures (32)	n/a	0.5	0.5
Qualified Professional to Review EIA (33)	n/a	1	1
Enforcement mechanism of EIA decisions (34)	n/a	1	1
Liability for Environmental Damages (35)	n/a	1	1
Public Consultations Requirement Elements	n/a	1	1
- Information in a form and language understandable to project-affected	n/a	0.33	0.33
parties and other interested parties (28)		0.33	0.33
- Clear and accessible information (in an accessible place, online, in gazettes, media etc.) (29)	n/a	0.33	0.33
- Capacity buildings (training, resources, and technical assistance to stakeholders, as needed) (30)	n/a	0.33	0.33
Disclosure of EIA information (27)	n/a	1	1
Total Points	0	13	13
1.4.2 Dispute Mechanisms for Construction-Related Environme	ental Permits		
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points
Ability to Dispute Environmental Clearances and Permits (36)	1	1	2
Out of Court Resolution Mechanisms for Environmental Disputes	1	1	2
- Arbitration (37)	0.5	0.5	1
- Conciliation or Mediation (38)	0.5	0.5	1
Total Points	2	2	4

Note: EIA = Environmental Impact Assessment; FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

PILLAR II-QUALI FOR BUSINESS LO	TTY OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION OCATION
Parameters	
Business Location	The largest (most populous) city in the economy. The parameter is used in cases where regulations may not be applicable at a national level and vary across states or regions. Geographical location determines the agency governing environmental permits, as well as the type of permits required. For all questions in Pillar II, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se.
Type and Size of Project	The type and size of project (housing development project) determines the type of environmental permitting required. A specific parameter of the construction of a new residential dwelling housing development project is provided, with a total surface area of

residential housing development project of 10 acres (40,468 sqm). The type of residence considered is detached single family house with 1, 2, and 3 bedrooms, each with its own driveway, and the estimated number of houses are 100 single family homes, with an estimated 600 residents.

2.1 AVAILABILITY AND RELIABILITY OF DIGITAL SERVICES

2.1.5 Environmental Permits-Digital Public Services

- 39. Is there an electronic system that facilitates public participation for environmental permitting? (Y/N)
- 40. Can the fees for obtaining environmental permits in [CITY] be paid through an online payment system (i.e. a portal specialized in online payment transactions)? (Y/N)
- 41. Is there an electronic system that facilitates the online communication between users and the authorities for obtaining environmental permits in [CITY]? (Y/N)
- 42. Is there an electronic system that facilitates the online submission of documents for obtaining environmental permits in [CITY]? (Y/N)

 $Y \rightarrow$ Provide response to question 43.

- 43. When submitting the documentation for obtaining environmental permits electronically, is it also necessary to send paper copies? $(Y/N) N \rightarrow good practice$
- 44. Is there an auto-generated checklist of documents that help users ensure they have submitted all necessary documents for obtaining environmental permits in [CITY]? (Y/N)
- 45. Can final decisions on environmental permits be appealed online? (Y/N)

2.1 AVAILABILITY AND RELIABILITY OF DIGITAL SERVICES				
2.1.5 Environmental Permits-Digital Public Services				
Indicators FFP SBP Tot Poin				
Online Permitting Systems to Facilitate Public Participation (39)				
Online Permitting Systems with Several Functionalities 1 1				
- Online payment (40)	0.25	0.25	0.5	
- Online communication (41)	0.25	0.25	0.5	
- Online submission (42)	0.25	0.25	0.5	
- Auto-generated checklist (44) 0.25 0.25		0.5		
Paper Copies Required in Conjunction with Online Submission (43) 1 1			2	
File a Dispute Online on Environmental Licensing (45)			2	
Total Points	4	4	8	

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

2.3 TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION

2.3.3 Environmental Permits

- 46. Are the requirements for submitting an application to obtain environmental clearances or permits for constructing a building in [CITY] available online? (Y/N)
- 47. Is the current fee schedule applicable for environmental permits in [CITY] as of September 2024 available online? (Y/N)
- 48. Is there public, official and updated information that shows a list or total number of approved EIAs in [ECONOMY]? (Y/N)

2.3 TRANSPARENCY OF INFORMATION					
2.3.3 Environmental Permits					
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points		
Public Online Availability of Environmental Licensing Requirements for Moderate-Risk Construction Project (46)	1	1	2		
Applicable and Up to Date Fee Schedule for Environmental Clearances (47)	1	1	2		
Availability of Official, Updated and Publicly Available List of approved EIAs (48)	1	1	2		
Total Points	3	3	6		

Note: FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.

PILLAR III-OPERATIONAL EFFICIENCY OF ESTABLISHING A BUSINESS LOCATION

The scores for Pillar III indicators are calculated using the Normal Cumulative Density Function (CDF) transformation method on a scale of 0 to 100, where 0 and 100 represent the lowest and highest possible scores, respectively. The best and worst performers are identified based on the 5th and 95th percentiles of the collected data.

The data for Pillar III on the Operational Efficiency of Environmental Permits will be collected primarily through expert consultations using the following parameters:

PILLAR III-OPERATIONAL EFFICIENCY OF ESTABLISHING A BUSINESS LOCATION				
Parameters				
Business Location	The largest (most populous city) in the economy. The parameter is used in cases where regulations may not be applicable at a national level and vary across states or regions. Geographical location determines the agency governing environmental permits, as well as the type of clearances required. For all questions in Pillar III, the experts will be asked to provide their response accounting for this specific parameter unless specified otherwise in the question per se.			
Type and Size of	The type and size of project (housing development project of 10 acres, 100 houses, 600			
Project	residents) determines the type of environmental permitting required and cost.			

3.3 ENVIRONMENTAL PERMIT

When providing the time and cost, please consider the time for each process and whether they can be done simultaneously with another process, and when applicable, provide the costs in local currency and only the official costs.

- 49. For the housing development project as described above, what kind of Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) would be required? (not scored)
 - 49a. Self-declaration of compliance with environmental regulations
 - 49b. Simplified Environmental Impact Assessment (i.e., environmental permit involving environmental study with limited scope)
 - 49c. Full Environmental Impact Assessment (see glossary for definition)
 - 49d. No Environmental Impact Assessment applies to such a project
 - 49e. Other
- 49.1 Please specify what kind of Environmental Impact Assessment process is required for the housing development project as described above:
- 49.2 Please specify the law that outlines the requirements and type of Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) required for the project described above:

For the housing development project as described above, which of the following other environmental clearances are required? (questions 50 through 54)

- **50. Pollution** (Y/N)
- 51. Extraction of water resources (Y/N)
- **52.** Water management and recycling (Y/N)
- **53.** Wastewater treatment (Y/N)
- **54.** Other (Y/N)

3.3.1 Time to Obtain an Environmental Permit

When answering the questions below, please consider, for the housing development project as outlined above:

- i. What is applicable in [ECONOMY] based on the regulatory framework to complete an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and/or other environmental permits.
- ii. All steps officially required by law and/or commonly done in practice to obtain an environmental clearance where <u>public services offered</u> by respective authorities are <u>directly involved</u>. This may include, but is not limited to, acquiring information on environmental clearance requirements, confirming if an EIA is required and submitting the necessary documents for approval. <u>However, steps that do not involve direct public service participation, such as the time and cost of hiring consultants to prepare reports, will NOT be considered.</u>
- iii. For questions 55-58, if this step is not officially required by law and/or commonly done in practice for this kind of project, mark n/a.
- 55. For a housing development project as outlined above, how many <u>calendar days</u> will it take to obtain confirmation from respective authorities on the need for an EIA and/or environmental

- <u>permits</u>? (If this step is not officially required by law and/or commonly done in practice for this kind of project, mark n/a.) (not scored)
- 56. For a housing development project as outlined above, how many <u>calendar days</u> will it take to obtain information from the respective authorities on <u>all the necessary requirements</u> the project must comply with (details on needed clearances and steps for both EIA and/or environmental permits)? (If this step is not officially required by law and/or commonly done in practice for this kind of project, mark n/a) (not scored)
- 57. Upon submission of all the required environmental documentation (impact assessments, and other) to the respective authorities, how many <u>calendar days</u> will it take to receive an <u>answer</u> on the completeness of that documentation? (If this step is not officially required by law and/or commonly done in practice for this kind of project, mark n/a) (not scored)
- 58. Upon receiving satisfactory submission of all environmental documentation to the respective authorities, how many <u>calendar days</u> will it take for public authorities to conduct <u>public consultation</u> (from the time of advertising to the completion of consultation phase)? (If this step is not officially required by law and/or commonly done in practice for this kind of project, mark n/a) (not scored)
- 59. Upon satisfactory completion and submission of all environmental documentation to the respective authorities, how many <u>calendar days</u> will it take for the respective authorities to officially grant clearance? (If this step is not officially required by law and/or commonly done in practice for this kind of project, mark n/a) (not scored)
- 60. Counting from the time of the submission of required environmental documentation until its final clearance, what is the total time for all permits and clearances (in calendar days)?

3.3.2 Cost to Obtain an Environmental Permit

61. Considering all costs involved from the submission of required environmental documentation until its final clearance, what is the total cost for all permits and clearances (in local currency)?

3.3 ENVIRONMENTAL PERMIT						
3.3.1 Time to Obtain an Environmental Permit						
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points			
Time to Obtain an Environmental Permit (60) Further collaborated with 55, 56, 57, 58, 59	100 (100%)	n/a	100 (100%)			
Total Points for Subcategory 3.3.1	100	n/a	100			
3.3.2 Cost to Obtain an Environmental Permit						
Indicators	FFP	SBP	Total Points			
Cost to Obtain an Environmental Permit (61)	100 (100%)	n/a	100 (100%)			
Total Points for Subcategory 3.3.2	100	n/a	100			
Total Points for Category 3.3	100	n/a	100			

Note: n/a = not applicable (refers to the cases when the impact on firms or society is either ambiguous or nonexistent). FFP = Firm Flexibility Point; SBP = Social Benefits Point.